

DOI: 10.18778/2084-140X.09.35

Elwira Kaczyńska (Łódź)

https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4545-1927

Krzysztof Tomasz Witczak (Łódź)

https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8895-974X

## THE UNDYING CONTROVERSY OF THE PRESENCE OF SLAVS ON THE ISLAND OF CRETE. REMARKS ON A NEW BOOK BY PANTELIS HARALAMPAKIS

Three years ago, Pantelis Haralampakis (Παντελής Χαραλαμπάκης) published his book entitled Σλάβοι στην Κρήτη κατά τον Μεσαίωνα και τους πρώιμους νεότερους χρόνους (Ιστορικά και γλωσσικά τεκμήρια) [Slavs on Crete in the Middle Ages and the Early Modern Times (Historical and Linguistic Evidence)], Andy's Publishers, Athens 2016, pp. 340. We intend to discuss not only the contents of the book, but also the conclusions offered by the author and what he managed to accomplish through his work.

The monograph under review (Haralampakis 2016) caps years of studying the issue of the Slavic presence in Crete and Slavic lexical influence on the Cretan dialect of Modern Greek and on the island's toponymy. The work is clearly divided into two parts. First (p. 15-85), the author discusses historical data, from the 7th century up until the Ottoman conquest of the island (between 1645 and 1669). He also looks at research hypotheses concerning the putative presence of the Slavs in Crete, which is suggested by both Greek and foreign scholars. Then (p. 87-238), Mr. Pantelis Haralampakis (henceforth PH) presents linguistic evidence, of both lexical (Slavic loans) and onomastic (i.e. Cretan toponyms of supposed Slavic origins) character. The monograph includes (aside from a preface and introduction, p. 5-14) a rather detailed summary (p. 239-251), a Greek translation of Czech traveler Jan Hasišteinský's 1493 account concerning Crete (p. 253-266), a comprehensive list of reference books (p. 267-290), pictures (p. 291-297), a summary in English (p. 299-305), indexes (p. 307-337), and a table of contents (p. 339–340). Already a look at the book's contents proves that the author devotes twice as much place to linguistic argumentation and documentation as he does to historical data.

The issue of the Slavic presence in Crete has been widely studied by both Greek and foreign scholars<sup>1</sup>. The earliest works discussing the Slavic settlement of Crete were authored by Bulgarian historians<sup>2</sup>. Unfortunately, the medieval

1 Ν.Β. Τωμαδακής, Σλάβοι στην Κρήτη. Τα Καράνου. Το Ροδοβάνι [N.V. Tomadakis, Slavs in Crete. Place-names Karanou. Rodovani], ΕΕΚΣ 1, 1938, p. 425-431; idem, Συμβολή εις την μελέτην των σλαβικών, αρμενικών και τουρκικών εποικίσεων εν Κρήτη [A Contribution to the Study of Slavic, Armenian and Turkish Settlements in Crete], ΕΕΚΣ 2, 1939, p. 7-19; IDEM, Αι περί Μακεδόνων Σκλάβων εν Κρήτη ειδήσεις Ιωσήφ Βρυεννίου (1401) [Joseph Vryennios' Testimony on Macedonian Slaves in Crete (1401)], [in:] Γέρας Αντωνίου Κεραμόπουλου, Αθήνα 1953, p. 105-111. See also M. VASMER, Die Slaven in Griechenland, Berlin 1941 [repr. Leipzig 1970]; Й. Заимов, Заселване на българската Славяни на Балканския полуостров. Проучване на жителските имена в българската топонимия [J. ZAIMOV, Settlement of the Bulgarian Slavs on the Balkan Peninsula. Study of Inhabited Place Names in the Bulgarian Торопуту], София 1967.

<sup>2</sup> Й. Шишмановъ, Славянски селища въ Крите и на другите острови [I. Šīšmanov, Slavic Settlements on Crete and other Islands], БП 4, 3, 1897, р. 2–38; И. Саказов, Новоодкрити документы отъ края на XIV. въкъ за булгари отъ Македония продавани като роби [I. Sakazov, New Documents from the End of the 14<sup>th</sup> Century Referring to Bulgars from Macedonia Sold as Slaves], RMac 7, 2/3, 1932,

period provides little relevant data and essentially each extant source needs to be considered. Usually, the first appearance of the Slavs in Crete is associated with Thomas the Presbyter's account concerning the Slavic invasion of Crete in 623. The original text has survived in Syrian and is quoted below in a literal English translation: The Slavs invaded Crete and the other islands. There some blessed men of Qenneshrē were taken captive and some twenty of them were killed3. This information has not been independently verified but this is hardly surprising in the early medieval context. Most historians consider Thomas the Presbyter's account reliable but PH argues that it contains many inconsistencies. First, no place called Qēnneshrē exists in Crete. This name refers to a village in Syria, near the Euphrates, where an early Christian monastery was located. Secondly, if the monks lived is Syria, their death cannot have anything to do with Crete or other Aegean islands. Thirdly, the information has not been independently corroborated, with the 7th century being typically mentioned in the context of Arab raids. What is more, the Arabs were known for plundering monasteries and did not stop short of killing Christian monks. PH suggests that Thomas the Presbyter mistook the Arabs for the Slavs (p. 18-22). The weak part of this argument is a well-known fact that the Arab conquests only started after Mahomet's death (in 632 AD) and the Byzantine Syria was conquered by the Arabs between 634 and 640. Meanwhile, the Qēnneshrē monks died in 623 in Crete, which at that time was part of the Byzantine Empire. Of course, we may assume that Thomas the Presbyter made a significant mistake dating the events (by a several-year margin), or even that the Qenneshre monks fled to Crete fearing the Arab terror. However, the chronicler unambiguously identified the killers of the Syrian monks as Slavs, and it is unlikely that a Syrian author should have confused the Arabs and the Slavs. For that reason, the accuracy of Thomas's account is not called into question. His narrative is reliable because it does not focus on the raid

itself but rather on the fortunes of twenty Syrian monks captured and killed by the Slavs during the invasion of Crete and the neighboring islands. Thomas does not explain why there were Syrian monks in Crete or whether the Slavs took control of the island or merely raided it. Only the first scenario would justify dating early Slavic settlement in Crete already to the 7<sup>th</sup> century. There is no independent verification of the Slavic invasion of Crete in 623 and theoretically doubts may be raised as to whether it happened, but there are no grounds for questioning the Slavic attacks on Crete and other islands in the 7<sup>th</sup> century or the grisly death of Syrian monks at the hands of Slavic attackers.

Most scholars believe that the Slavic settlement of Crete only began in 961. The island was conquered by the Arabs around 824. The Byzantine Empire made a few attempts to regain Crete, but their numerous military operations had failed4. It was only in 961 that Nikephoros Phokas, a brilliant Byzantine military commander and a future emperor (between 963 and 969) reconquered Crete and reintegrated it into the Byzantine Empire. Next, in order to secure the island against another Arab invasion, the Byzantine authorities relocated war veterans there. The Byzantine army under the command of Nikephoros Phokas had in its ranks Russian, Bulgarian, and other Slavic mercenaries, so Greek historians believe that the first Slavic settlements in Crete were established after 961, in the form of military camps under the auspices of the Byzantine Empire. After a couple of centuries in the Greek environment, the Slavic inhabitants of these settlements had been completely Hellenized. It is speculated that the Cretan family name *Sclavo* (Mod. Gr. Σκλάβος), recorded in Venetian sources, proves the Slavic ancestry of its bearers. PH rejects the hypothesis about the settlement of Slavic veterans in Crete, remarking that Slavic place names in the island are only recorded in Venetian documents from between the 13th and 17th centuries. However, it needs to be noted that the Greek sources from the second Byzantine period (i.e. between 961 and 1204) record only a handful of Cretan

p. 1-62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> A. PALMER, *The Seventh Century in the West-Syrian Chronicles*, Liverpool 1993, p. 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> T.E. Detorakis, *History of Crete*, trans. J.C. Davis, Iraklion 1994, p. 126–128.

oeconyms: these are mostly the names of former settlements where the dwellings of Church hierarchs (bishops) were located, rather than new settlements founded by the colonists or war veterans. Elsewhere in his book, PH discusses later data from the Venetian period (between 1204 and 1669), which mention a South Slavic lineage of some Cretans. Since these particular aspects are not contested, we are not discussing them in this review.

After presenting historical data, PH proceeds to discuss the Cretan dialectal lexemes of suspected Slavic origin and divides the entire material into four parts:

Group A: appellatives of Slavic origin in the Cretan dialect (p. 89-127): βέρα f. 'covenant, armistice, temporary peace, reconciliation' (< Proto-Slavic \*věra f. 'faith, trust'); βλάτος m. 'bog, mud' (< PSl. \*bolto n. 'id.'); (τ)ζούμπερο n. 'a breeding animal, esp. a sheep, goat, cow' (< PSl. \*zobro m. 'bison'); καπίκι n. 'kopek; an old Russian coin' (< Russ. копейка); λέσκα f. 'a place where wild goats live; a steep place where animals are usually captured'; σβαρνάς m. 'a slightly curved garden knife with a toothed blade, also σβάρνα f. 'an agricultural tool for leveling the ploughed surface in the form of a plank with metal teeth; a harrow' (< PSl. \*borna f.); σκλέπα f. 'a disease affecting horses'. Therefore, PH identifies seven certain Slavic loans.

Group B: Cretan appellatives of possible Slavic origin (p. 127–132): κρουσέβα f. 'companionship, company, venture';  $\lambda$ άσω 'to shout in order to drive animals to a pen';  $\sigma$ ταλίζω 'to lead animals to a shadowy place during scorching hot'.

Group C: words erroneously classified as Slavic (p. 133–146): βιστιρά f. 'suffering, a disease caused by demonic forces'; ζάκα f. 'long-term unrevealed concerns', ζακώνω 'to worry, to fret, to conceal suffering'; κάραβος m. 'small stream; canal; sewage drain'; κοσαριά f. 'shepherd's hut income; sheep's pen'; κόκκορας or κόκκοτας m. 'rooster'; κούρβα f. 'prostitute'; κουρούπα f. 'a water pitcher; a clay vessel'; ρούσος adj. 'red, reddish, flame-colored'; τσέργα f. 'a woolen blanket'; τσεργώνω 'to mend sth'.

Group D: Slavic words occurring in Modern Greek (p. 146-166): βάλτος n. 'mud, bog'; βαρικός adj. 'damp, boggy'; βέδουρα f. 'a wooden basket for milk or sour milk'; βερβερίτσα f. 'squirrel'; βίτσα f. 'stick'; βλάσατα n. pl. 'sheep or other long-furred animals'; βουρκόλακας m. 'a dead man whose body is not decomposing and who raises from the tomb to drink somebody's blood'; γκλάβα f. 'head'; γουστερίτσα f. 'green lizard, Lacerta viridis Laurenti'; γρανίτσα f. 'downy oak, Quercus pubescens Willd.'; δόμπρος or ντόμπρος adj. 'honest, reliable'; ζάμπα f. 'a kind of frog'; κανιάς m. 'a large bird of prey'; (γ)κλίτσα f. 'shepherd's crook'; κοιλιοβέδουρα n. pl. 'animal's intestines'; κοκ(κ)ορέτσι n. 'pistachio, Pistacia terebinthus L.; a giblet shashlik'; κοτέτσι n. 'henhouse'; λαγκάδι n. 'valley, gorge'; λομποδιά f. 'dittany'; μπέμπελη f. 'measles'; μαρκάλα f. 'the period of sheep's copulation'; μόρα f. 'a mare; an epidemic disease'; uoyóc m. 'moss used for starting a fire'; μπίστρος adj. 'hawkeyed; clever'; πέστροφα f. 'trout'; πίστρος adj. 'mottled, spotted (of a hen)'; ραγάζι n. 'a species of grass with a spike-like inflorescence, Imperata cylindrica Beauvois'; ρούσος adj. 'red, reddish, flame-colored'; ρούχο n. 'garment; σβάρνα f. 'harrow; σήτα f. 'flour sieve'; στουμπίζω 'to smash with a stone'; τσαντίλα f. 'a thin fabric used for filtering milk; a pouch for filtering curd'; τσίπα f. 'a sticky film across the top of milk or water; a cigarette stub; τσιπαλιδιάζω 'to create a film across the top of milk'.

The author's division of the lexemes into particular groups is mostly clear although assigning some of the words to groups A and D may be questioned. For example, the word  $\sigma\kappa\lambda\dot{\epsilon}\pi\alpha$ , which is presently unknown in the island but is attested in the Cretan epigraphy between 13<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup> centuries, was – according to PH – once used in other regions of Greece (including North Macedonia, Laconia, and Arcadia). A question thus arises as to why PH classified this word as a Cretan dialectal vocabulary item (group A). It is additionally worth noting that the word  $\sigma\kappa\lambda\dot{\epsilon}\pi\alpha$  is attested in the Byzantine *Hippiatrica*<sup>5</sup>, and also in the modern

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Corpus Hippiatricorum Graecorum, vol. II, Hippiatrica Parisina Cantabrigiensia Londinensia Lugdunensia, Appendix, ed. E. Oder, C. Hoppe, Lipsiae 1927, p. 289, 298.

period in the sense of 'Aussatz / leprosy' in Arcadia, and in the sense of 'Kopfgrind / dermatophytosis' in the Pontic area (Trabzon)6. In the previous centuries, the word βέρα was known not only in Crete but also in other regions of Greece (Chios, Euboea, Skopelos)7. What is more, we cannot agree with Max Vasmer and PH, who claim that the Cretan word βέρα f. 'covenant, armistice, temporary peace, reconciliation' represents a South Slavic borrowing. It is worth noting that in his monumental work on the Arkadi monastery Timotheos Veneris, the metropolitan bishop of Crete between 1934 and 1941, explained the rare word βέρα used in a Cretan folk song from the end of the 19th century and correctly pointed to its Ottoman provenance: "βέρα, παραφθορά της τουρκ. λέξεως βερέ = το παραδίδεσθαι, παράδοσις. Βέρε μπαϊραγί = σημαία παραδόσεως, πολιορκουμένων" [βέρα, a corruption of the Turkish word vère = capitulation, surrender. Vèrebay $ra\check{g}i = flag of surrender (of besieged people)]^8$ . Also Romanian veră 'capitulation' is a borrowing from Turkish vère 'capitulation, surrender'9. In short, we maintain our stance from 11 years ago, namely that Slavic influence on Cretan dialectal vocabulary is rather weak and concerns approx. 30 appellatives<sup>10</sup>.

Slavic supra-regional loans into Greek should be widely-known in Crete. Meanwhile, the word τσαντίλα f. 'a thin fabric used for filtering milk' is only attested in the island in the Apokoronas eparchy<sup>11</sup>. In the other parts of the island, the word τυροπάνι n. 'id.' is used. PH is critical of the set of Slavic loans attested in Cretan speech which we suggested and sometimes questions whether some of the terms are in use in Crete. For example, he claims that he has never heard a native Cretan use the word γκλάβα f. 'a head', adding that no dictionary of the Cretan dialect has recorded this word (p. 152). However, a different opinion was expressed by Eustathios Petrulakis (from the Cretan town of Rhethymno), who at the beginning of the 20th century (before 1905) confirmed beyond all doubt that this word was used in Crete<sup>12</sup>. PH writes that the phytonym γρανίτσα f. 'downy oak, Quercus pubescens Willd.' has not been

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> G. Meyer, Etymologisches Wörterbuch der albanesischen Sprache, Strassburg 1891, p. 125. The appellative σκλέπα f. 'lichen, dermatophytosis of the head, festering wound / κασίδα του κεφαλιού, πληγή πυορροούσα' is still used in the Pontic dialect of Modern Greek, see on-line: http://www.pontos-news.gr/lexicon/words/σκλέπα [12 V 2019].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> E. Kaczyńska, Rozważania o domniemanym sławizmie w dialekcie kreteńskim języka nowogreckiego [Considerations on an Alleged Slavism in the Cretan Dialect of Modern Greek], RHu 64, 6, 2016, p. 31–50.
<sup>8</sup> T.M. Benephe, Το Αρκάδι δια των αιώνων [T.M. Veneris, The Arkadi Monastery through the Ages], Αθήνα 1938, p. 352, fn. 3. See also Γ.Ε. ΑΠΟΣΤΟΛΑΚΗΣ, Αρκάδι σύμβολο αυτοθυσίας. Ρίμες. Κρητικό γλωσσικό ιδίωμα [G.Ε. ΑΡΟSΤΟLΑΚΙS, Arkadi – a Symbol of Selfsacrifice. Rhymes. Cretan Language Dialect], Ηράκλειο 2014, p. 116.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> H.F. Wendt, *Die türkischen Elemente im Rumänischen*, Berlin 1960, p. 120. See additionally H.C. Hony, F. Iz, *A Turkish-English Dictionary*, Oxford 1947, p. 368 (s.v. vère).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> E. Kaczyńska, K.T. Witczak, Elementy słowiańskie w leksyce kreteńskiej [Slavic Elements in the Cretan Vocabulary], RKJŁTN 53, 2008, p. 129–146.

<sup>11</sup> A.B. ΞΑΝΘΙΝΑΚΗΣ, Λεξικό ερμηνευτικό και ετυμολογικό του δυτικοκρητικού γλωσσικού ιδιώματος [A.V. ΧΑΝΤΗΙΝΑΚΙS, Explanatory and Etymological Dictionary of the West Cretan Dialect], 'Iraklion 2009, p. 667. This loan comes, without a doubt, from South Slavic languages, cf. OCS. μπδαπο n. 'an appliance for filtering', Bg. dial. μεδαπο 'a filter; a thin fabric for filtering', also 'a woolen sheet for carrying children', Mac. μεδαπο 'an appliance for filtering milk and other liquids', also 'a sheet for covering loaves on a board', Sloven. cedilo 'a sieve, a vessel for filtering', SCr. cjèdilo n. 'an appliance for filtering water, milk, wine' < PSI. \*cēdidlo n. 'an appliance for filtering liquids; a piece of fabric for filtering milk', cf. Pol. cedzidło 'an appliance for filtering, a filter').

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> P. Kretschmer, Der heutige lesbische Dialekt verglichen mit den übrigen nordgriechischen Mundarten, Wien 1905, p. 434. Then, W. Budziszewska, Zapożyczenia słowiańskie w dialektach nowogreckich [Slavic Borrowings in the Modern Greek Dialects], Warszawa 1991, p. 16, writes (without stating a reference) that in the Cretan province of Chania the phrase έχεις σκληρή γκλάβα 'you have a hard head (= you are stubborn)' is used.

recorded in any dictionary of the Cretan dialect. However, already German botanist Theodor von Heldreich (1822-1902) and his student Spirydon Miliarakis (1852-1919) pointed out that in the 19th century and at the beginning of the 20th century this term was not yet supra-regional and only occurred in Crete, Attica, and Phocis (Parnassos)13. The explanation for this may be two-fold. Firstly, some words lose their previous productivity, give way to their synonyms, and gradually fall out of use. Secondly, the authors of dialectal dictionaries do not include those words which - in their opinion - come from the Modern Greek koine. For that reason, the dictionaries of the Cretan dialect do not include the word βερβερίτσα f. 'a squirrel' (this animal does not live in Crete) although the Cretans know this word and commonly use it. Any Cretan child will easily recognize and name a squirrel, just as they will a fox, a lion, a bear, and a giraffe, although these animals do not live in Crete either. PH emphasizes (p. 89) that the word βέρα f. 'an engagement ring' (which was at one point borrowed from the Venetian dialect of Italian) is commonly used in Crete, and it may be quickly verified that most authors of dictionaries of the Cretan dialect leave out this word on purpose, erroneously assuming that this is not an original dialectal term but a loan from the Modern Greek koine. PH also casts doubt on the purely Cretan character of the words γουστερίτσα f. 'lizard', ζάμπα f. 'a kind of frog', and κανιάς m. 'some bird of prey (a kite?)', even though 40 years ago Eleutherios Platakis, a native Cretan, included these words on his list of Cretan names of animals14.

In the third part of the monograph (p. 167–238), PH discusses the Cretan place

names of Slavic origin, dividing the onomastic material into three parts:

Group A: Cretan toponyms and micro-toponyms of Slavic provenance (p. 167–186): Βλάτος; Βοράδω; Βορί (two locations); Βόροι; Βορού (two locations); Ζίντα; Ντουλιανά; Ζάχουντο; Λέσκα; Ροδοβάνι; Σεμπρώνας; Σκλαβολάσι; Τοπόλια; Τσεπέλι (and Τσεπελάκι); Χαρβάτα.

Group B: Cretan (micro-)toponyms of likely Slavic provenance (p. 186–213): Ακαράνου; Βολιάρες; Βουργάρα; Γαράζο; Γλαμπές οτας Γλαμπές; Γλαμπιανών; Γράντος; Κάνεβα; Κράπη; Μιχαλίνσκι; Μούντρος; Νιβγορίτης; Πρέβελη; Πρεβελιανά; Σκλαβούνου Σώχωρο; Σκλαβούνου το μετόχι (twice); Σταλός; Τοπλού; Τσούτσουρας / Τσούτσουρος; Χουδέτσι.

Group C: Cretan (micro-)toponyms erroneously classified as Slavic or Greek place names containing Slavic elements (p. 213-238): Αλητζανή; Βαβέλοι; Βάλτος; Βαρβάροι; Βαρβάρος; Βαρβάρω(ν); Βόιλα; Βουλγάρω(ν) (two toponyms); Γαβρανού; Δραγασανά; Ζαγουριάνοι; Λαγκά; Λαγκές; Μαλεβίζι; Μοχός; Πλεμένης Λαγκός; Πλεμενιανά; Πλεμένο; Πλεμένου; Ρούσα Εκκλησά; Ρουσακιανά; Ρουσαναυλή; Ρουσαπίδια; Ρουσολιμενάρι; Ρούσο σπίτι; Ρουσσές; Ρουσ(σ)οχώρια; Σέρβο; Σκλαβεδιάκο; Σκλαβεροχώρι; Σκλαβιανά (two names); Σκλαβοβάθεια; Σκλάβοι; Σκλαβόκαμπος; Σκλαβοπούλα; Σκλάβου το μουρί; Σκλαβοχώρι; Σκλαβοχωριό; Σφηνάρι; Χαρασό.

It is surprising that in the third part of the monograph PH does not make even a single reference to the two-volume work on Modern Greek oeconymy by Haralampos Symeonidis, an eminent Greek expert on linguistics and onomastics<sup>15</sup>. What is more, PH does not list this monumental dictionary in his bibliography. In order to present the great complexity of the research problem, we quote Symeonidis's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> T. VON HELDREICH, Τα δημώδη ονόματα των φυτών [The Folk Names of Plants], 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. prepared by S. MILIARAKIS, Αθήνα 1919 [repr. 2011], p. 109. See also W. BUDZISZEWSKA, Zapożyczenia..., p. 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See E. ΠΛΑΤΑΚΗΣ, Δημώδη ονόματα ζώων της Κρήτης [E. PLATAKIS, Folk Names of Animals of Crete], Κρη 10/11, 1980, p. 35–134.

<sup>15</sup> Χ.Π. ΣΥΜΕΩΝΙΔΗΣ, Ετυμολογικό λεξικό των νεοελληνικών οικωνυμίων [H.P. Symeonidis, Etymological Dictionary of the Modern Greek Place-names], vol. I–II, Λευκωσία—Θεσσαλονίκη 2010.

opinions concerning selected Cretan oeconyms which – according to PH's opinion – are of Slavic provenance.

The name of the village of Βλάτος (Kissamos, Chania), which appears in Venetian sources as *Vlatos* (1583; 1630) is – according to Symeonidis¹6 – inspired by the Cretan dialectal appellative βλάτος n. 'a muddy place' (whose genesis is identical to that of Mod. Gr. βάλτο n. or βάλτος n. 'id.'). Symeonidis postulates purely Greek origins of this oeconym, while PH argues in favor of its Slavic provenance (p. 167). We tend to agree that the Cretan appellative βλάτος, on which the place name is based, is an old Slavic loan, but this fact by no means proves that the village was originally a Slavic settlement.

There are two Cretan oeconyms Bopí ([1] Kissamos, Chania; [2] Sitia, Lasithi). The former was recorded in the Venetian period (1583) and the latter in the 19th century (Vuriá 1834; Bopí 1881). PH argues in favor of the Slavic origins of both (p. 168-171). Symeonidis, on the other hand, believes that the place name derives from the Greek appellative \*βορί, a diminutive of Mod. Gr. βορός m. 'a room for animals' (< PSl. oborv)17. In his opinion, the origins of the village are purely Greek, although the appellative serving as the basis is a South-Slavic loan. Symeonidis also quotes N.G. Katapotis, who claims that the place name comes from the family name \*Boρής. We are of the opinion that the Cretan place name Bopí appeared in the course of inflectional derivation (του Βορή > το Βορί).

The oeconym Ziντα (Monofatsiou, Iraklion) appears in Venetian sources as *Sinda* (1380), *Sida* (1583), *Sinda* (1630), and in Turkish documents as *Zide* (1671), *Zidá* (1834). Symeonidis, invoking K. Amantos, suspects that the Cretan place name is the continuation of the Doric name \*Σίδᾶ, cf. Old Gr. σίδη f. 'a tree or fruit of pomegranate, *Punica granatum* L.'¹8. He also quotes a contrasting opinion of S. Xanthudidis, who claims that the oeconym comes from the Venetian family name *Zinta*,

which was attested in Cretan sources in 1475 (*Alexandro Zinta*). The family-name provenance of the place name seems more probable. PH advocates the Slavic hypothesis, linking the Cretan place name with the Polish family name of *Zynda* or *Żynda* (p. 171).

The Cretan toponym Ντουλιανά (Apokoronou, Chania) is only recorded in historical sources in the 19th century (Dulianá 1834, Δουλιανά 1881; Ντουλιανά 1920). PH posits Slavic origins of the proper name in question, which - in his opinion - apparently comes from PSl. \*dolv m. 'a hole, a concavity or a dug-up pit; a ditch; a moat; a nether area surrounded by hills, a valley' (p. 172-173). According to Symeonidis, the provenance of the place name is unclear<sup>19</sup>. He also refers to the argumentation of Zaimov<sup>20,</sup> who claims that the Cretan village got its name from Slavic \*Duljane or \*Duljana (cf. the Bulgarian toponym Ayana), derived from some South-Slavic appellative, cf. SCr. dial. dùlo, dúlo n. 'a pipe in the bellows through which you blow to induce fire; a cave in the ground out of which a stream flows; a large concavity, a cave in the ground; the bottom of a wooden vessel', Bg. дуло 'a pipe for watering a garden; a large opening of a pitcher', also 'the muzzle of a firearm' (< PSl. \*dudlo n. 'a hole, an outlet, a pipe'). Zaimov and Symeonidis compare the Cretan toponym with the name of the Albanian village of Dulyani, which is of Slavic provenance. Symeonidis's doubts about the validity of Zaimov's hypothesis appear well-founded. In Crete, there is a high number of oeconyms ending in -ιανά (n. pl.). All such items are derived from a proper name and exhibit the possessive meaning, indicating somebody's property. Theoretically, the name could come from a Slavic first name, cf. the Old Russian personal name Дуло (15th-16th c.), but it needs to be noted that Greek has recorded numerous family names such as Ντούλης, Ντούλας, Ντούλιας, Ντούλος, which derive from the Turkish word dul 'a widow, a widower'21. What

<sup>16</sup> Ibidem, vol. I, p. 363.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> *Ibidem*, vol. I, p. 371.

<sup>18</sup> Ibidem, vol. I, p. 549.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> *Ibidem*, vol. I, p. 488: "άγνωστης αρχής".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Й. Заимов, *Заселване...*, р. 129.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Β.Η. ΒΟΓΙΑΤΖΟΓΛΟΥ, Επώνυμα της Μικρασίας. Τουρκικά και τουρκογενή επώνυμα στην Ελλάδα [V.I. Vo-GIATZOGLOU, Surnames of Asia Minor. Ottoman and Turkish-like surnames in Greece], Αθήνα 1992, p. 77.

is more, appearing in Crete is also the family name Δούλης (from the Mod. Greek word δούλος m. 'a servant, a slave' < Old Gr. δοῦλος m. 'id.'), already attested in the Venetian period (1390) in the town of Peuko (Viannos, Iraklion)²². Consequently, it is problematic to argue in favor of the Slavic provenance of the Cretan place name Ντουλιανά (vel Δουλιανά), which is more easily traceable to a Greek possessive form, indicating a property of a man named Dulis (Mod. Gr. Ντούλης lub Δούλης).

Discussing the place name Σεμπρώνας (Kydonia, Chania), already attested in the 17th century (Sembrona 1577), Symeonidis refers to Mod. Gr. σέμπρος 'a peasant who as part of neighborhood assistance cultivates somebody else's land' (← South Slavic \*sebro), cf. SCr. (since 14th century) sember 'a farmer, a peasant, a person of low status', Sloven. seber 'id., BRuss. sjabr 'a neighbor'23. He does not explain if he considers the morpheme -ώνας to be a Greek derivational suffix or a South Slavic loan. PH is in favor of the latter option, classifying this name as purely Slavic (p. 177-179). On the other hand, Hrisoula Tsikritsi-Katsianaki argues that the oeconym Σεμπρώνας comes from the Greek family name Σέμπρος<sup>24</sup>.

Symeonidis does not discuss the micro-toponym Σκλαβολάσι, but he analyzes other Cretan oeconyms including the Σκλαβο- element, providing a comprehensive overview of various theories²5. Most scholars believe that toponyms such as Σκλαβοχωριό, Σκλάβοι, or Σκλαβόκαμπος testify to the Slavic presence on the island, or the presence of Greek inhabitants bearing the family name Σκλάβος. PH is right to reject the Slavic provenance of Cretan toponyms with the initial Σκλαβο- element, although at the same time he is of the opinion that the suffix -λάσι goes back to a Slavic source, cf. PSl. \*lėsa f. 'a wicker of twigs, a bar, a wicker fence, a fence'

(p. 179–180). However, there is no doubt that the Cretan name Σκλαβολάσι arose in the Hellenic context and was not borrowed from the old Slavic inhabitants of the island. Symeonidis points to an older meaning of Middle Greek σκλάβος 'slave' (initially 'a slave of Slavic origin' < 'a Slav'). He also quotes K. Amantos's isolated opinion that Mod. Gr. σκλάβος 'a species of grapevine or grape (of light yellow color)' is the base for the Cretan toponyms.

The oeconym Τοπόλια (Kissamos, Chania), attested in Venetian sources as *Topolia* (1577), *Topogla* (1583, 1630), is usually traced back to Mod. Gr. τοπόλι n. 'white poplar, *Populus alba* L.' (< PSI. \*topolь f. 'id.'). PH advocates the Slavic origins of this Cretan place name (p. 180–181), in line with other scholars<sup>26</sup>. Symeonidis postulates purely Greek origins based on Mod. Gr. τοπόλι, which was borrowed from a Slavic source. However, modern dictionaries of the Cretan dialect do not record the word τοπόλι.

The Cretan oeconym Χαρβάτα (Kissamos, Chania), first attested in 1920, was mentioned by Symeonidis under Χαρβάτι (Argos, Argolis)<sup>27</sup>. The place name Χαρβάτι either comes from the ethnic name of the Croats (PSl. \*Chorvati, Cr. Hrvati), or from the Greek name Χαρβάτης (lit. 'a Croat'). In the former scenario, the place name would indicate Slavic settlement in Crete (which PH agrees with), while in the latter this would not be as certain. A late attestation of the oeconym (1920) seems to suggest the proper-name provenance of the name Χαρβάτα.

A quick overview of select Cretan toponyms which PH classifies as purely Slavic demonstrates that the issue of Slavic influence on the toponymy and micro-toponymy of Crete is complex. H. Symeonidis, the author of an

<sup>1.</sup> a wicker of twigs, a bar, a wicker fence, a fence

22 Χ.Ζ. ΤΣΙΚΡΙΤΣΗ-ΚΑΤΣΙΑΝΑΚΗ, Συμβολή στη μελέτη των τοπωνυμίων της Κρήτης. Τοπωνύμια από οικογενειακά ονόματα [H.Z. TSIKRITSI-KATSIANAKI, A Contribution to Studying Toponyms of Crete. Toponyms

Derived from Surnames], A 6, 22–23, 1975, p. 50.
<sup>23</sup> Χ.Π. ΣΥΜΕΩΝΙΔΗΣ, Ετυμολογικό..., vol. II, p. 1257.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Χ.Ζ. ΤΣΙΚΡΙΤΣΗ-ΚΑΤΣΙΑΝΑΚΗ,  $\Sigma \nu \mu \beta o \lambda \dot{\eta}$ ..., p. 77.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Χ.Π. ΣΥΜΕΩΝΙΔΗΣ, Ετυμολογικό..., vol. II, p. 1278–1279.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> И. Шишмановъ, *Славянски*..., р. 90; N.В. ТΩма-ΔΑΚΗΣ, *Συμβολή*..., р. 10; M. Vasmer, *Die Slaven*..., р. 175; Х.П. ΣΥΜΕΩΝΙΔΗΣ, *Ετυμολογικό*..., vol. II, р. 1351–1352. It is worth emphasizing that Max Vasmer prefers a derivation of the Modern Greek place-name Τοπόλια (n. pl.) from the Common Slavic collective formation \**Topoloje* 'a collection of poplars; a poplar forest; a place overgrown with poplars / Pappelort'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Χ.Π. ΣΥΜΕΩΝΙΔΗΣ, Ετυμολογικό..., vol. II, p. 1433.

etymological dictionary of Greek oeconyms, favors alternative explanations of many Cretan place names.

The monograph under review is valuable in that PH presents the current state of research on the issue of the Slavic settlement of Crete and usually (though not always) sides with other Greek scholars. A number of issues is still open to debate. The chronology of the appearance of the first Slavic settlers in Crete is coming under much scrutiny and researchers are divided on this topic (the beginnings of the Slavic settlement are dated either to the 7th century, 10th century, or the beginning of the Venetian rule of the island, i.e. 13th-15th centuries). Also, the exact number of Slavic loans into the Cretan dialect is debatable. Overall, PH discusses 57 lexemes and decidedly rejects 12 of them. While some of the author's propositions are not convincing, there can be no doubt that the monograph under review is a substantial and stimulating contribution to studies of the Cretan dialectal vocabulary and the toponymy of Crete.

Translated by Maciej Grabski

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

APOSTOLAKĒS G.E., Arkadi symvolo autothysias. Rimes, Krētiko glōssiko idiōma, Ērakleio 2014.

Budziszewska W., Zapożyczenia słowiańskie w dialektach nowogreckich, Warszawa 1991.

Corpus Hippiatricorum Graecorum, vol. II, Hippiatrica Parisina Cantabrigiensia Londinensia Lugdunensia, Appendix, ed. E. Oder, C. Hoppe, Lipsiae 1927.

DETORAKIS T.E., *History of Crete*, trans. J.C. DAVIS, Iraklion 1994.

HARALAMPAKIS P., Slavoi stēn Krētē kata ton Mesaiōna kai tous prōimous neoterous chronous (istorika kai glōssika tekmēria, Athēna 2016.

Heldreich T. von, Ta dēmōdē onomata tōn fytōn,  $2^{nd}$  ed. prepared by S. Miliarakis, Athēna 1919 [repr. 2011].

HONY H.C., IZ F., A Turkish-English Dictionary, Oxford 1947.

KACZYŃSKA E., Rozważania o domniemanym slawizmie w dialekcie kreteńskim języka nowogreckiego, "Roczniki Humanistyczne" 64, 6, 2016, p. 31–50.

KACZYŃSKA E., WITCZAK K.T., Elementy słowiańskie w leksyce kreteńskiej, "Rozprawy Komisji Językowej ŁTN" 53, 2008, p. 129–146.

Kretschmer P., Der heutige lesbische Dialekt verglichen mit den übrigen nordgriechischen Mundarten, Wien 1905.

MEYER G., Etymologisches Wörterbuch der albanesischen Sprache, Strassburg 1891.

PALMER A., The Seventh Century in the West-Syrian Chronicles, Liverpool 1993.

Platakēs E., *Dēmōdē onomata zōōn tēs Krētēs*, "Κρητολογία" / "Krētologia" 10/11, 1980, p. 35–134.

SAKAZOV I., Novoodkriti dokumenty ot kraja na XIV. věk za bulgari ot Makedonija prodavani kato robi, "Revue Macédonienne" 7, 2–3, 1932, p. 1–62.

Šīšmanov I., Slavjanski selišta v Krite i na drugite ostrovi, "Български Преглед"/ "Bälgarski Pregled" 4, 3, 1897, p. 90–126.

SYMEŌNIDĒS H.P., Etymologiko lexiko tōn neoellēnikōn oikōnymiōn, vol. I–II, Leukōsia–Thessalonikē 2010.

TŌMADAKĒS N.V., Ai peri Makedonōn Sklávōn en Krētē eidēseis Iōsēf Vryenniou (1401), [in:] Geras Antōniou Keramopoulou, Athēna 1953, p. 105–111.

ΤΟΜΑΔΑΚΕ Ν.V., Slavoi stēn Krētē. Τα Karanou. Το Rodovani, "Επετηρίς Εταιρείας Κρητικών Σπουδών" / "Epetēris Etaireias Krētikōn Spoudōn" 1, 1938, p. 425–431.

ΤΟΜΑDAKĒS N.V., Symvolē eis tēn meletēn tōn slavikōn, armenikōn kai tourkikōn epoikiseōn en Krētē, "Επετηρίς Εταιρείας Κρητικών Σπουδών" / "Epetēris Etaireias Krētikōn Spoudōn" 2, 1939, p. 7–19.

TSIKRITSĒ-KATSIANAKĒ H.Z., Symvolē stē meletē tōn topōnymiōn tēs Krētēs. Topōnymia apo oikogeneiaka onomata, "Αμάλθεια" / "Amaltheia" 6, 22/23, 1975, p. 25–98.

Vasmer M., *Die Slaven in Griechenland*, Berlin 1941 [repr. Leipzig 1970].

VENERĒS T.M., To Arkadi dia tōn aiōnōn, Athēna 1938.

Vogiatzoglou V.I., Epōnyma tēs Mikrasias. Tourkika kai tourkogenē epōnyma stēn Ellada, Athēna 1992.

WENDT H.F., Die türkischen Elemente im Rumänischen, Berlin 1960.

Xanthinakės A.V., Lexiko ermēneutikó kai etymologiko tou dytikokrētikou glōssikou idiōmatos, <sup>4</sup>Iraklion 2009.

ZAIMOV J., Zaselvane na bŭlgarskata Slavjani na Balkanskija poluostrov. Proučvane na žitelskite imena v bălgarskata toponimija, Sofija 1967.

http://www.pontos-news.gr/lexicon/words/σκλέπα [12 V 2019].

Abstract. The paper demonstrates the current state of research on the presence of Slavs on the island of Crete in the Middle Ages, as well as in the modern times. The basis for the discussion is a new book of Pantelis Haralampakis, published in 2016. There are numerous controversies surrounding the issues of the exact chronology of Slavic presence on the island, the lexical influence of South Slavic languages on the Cretan dialect of Modern Greek, as well as possible traces of Slavic settlements in the Cretan toponymy.

**Keywords**: borrowings, Crete, onomastics, place names, Slavic, vocabulary

## Elwira Kaczyńska

University of Lodz Faculty of Philology Chair of Classical Philology ul. Pomorska 171/173 90-236 Łodź, Poland elwira.kaczynska@uni.lodz.pl

## Krzysztof Tomasz Witczak

University of Lodz Faculty of Philology Chair of Classical Philology ul. Pomorska 171/173 90-236 Łodź, Poland krzysztof.witczak@uni.lodz.pl