ISSN: 2084-140X e-ISSN: 2449-8378

COP Е Member since 2018

Daniel Asade (Buenos Aires)

Paola Druille (La Pampa) https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2648-2119

The Syriac Christianization of a Medical Greek Recipe: From *Barbaros Hera* to the "Apostles' Ointment"

Abstract. During the Late antiquity, several works by Galen (2nd-3th CE.) were translated into Syriac for the first time by Sergius of Rēš'aynā (6th CE.), starting up the Hippocratic-Galenic medicine in Syriac Language. Based on these translations, there arouse novel versions of compound medicines in Syriac, such as the "Apostles' Ointment" which is found in *The Book of Medicines*, possibly from Abassid period, edited and translated by E.A.W. Budge in 1913, which contains more ancient Syriac medical prescriptions. The textual pharmaceutical study regarding the therapeutic uses and qualitative composition of the 'Apostles' Ointment', and its comparison with a kind of plaster (*barbaros*) which appears in various Late antiquity Greek recipes (Galen, Oribasius, Aetius of Amida, and Paul of Aegina), reveal the micro-transformations suffered to a new and final Syriac Christian version which we here introduce.

Keywords: Apostles' Ointment, The Book of Medicines, Syriac, Greek tradition

Introduction

The "Apostles' Ointment" from the anonymous treatise known as *The Book of* $Medicines^1$ is the Syriac version of a medical prescription of Greek origin, used as plaster to treat bleeding wounds. A Greek similar recipe appears in chapter 22,

¹ Syrian Anatomy, Pathology and Therapeutics, or, The Book of Medicines, vol. I–II, ed. et trans. E.A.W. BUDGE, Oxford 1913 (cetera: The Book of Medicines I–II). For The Book of Medicines, cf. P. GIGNOUX, On the Syriac Pharmacopoeia, [in:] The Harp, vol. XI–XII, ed. G. PANICKER, J. THEK-EPARAMPIL, A. KALAKUDI, Boston–Berlin 2012, p. 193–202; S. BHAYRO, Theory and Practice in the Syriac Book of Medicines, [in:] In the Wake of the Compendia. Infrastructural Contexts and the Licensing of Empiricism in Ancient and Medieval Mesopotamia, ed. J. CALE JOHNSON, Boston–Berlin 2015 [= STMAC, 3], p. 147–158; D. ASADE, La literatura farmacéutica siríaca y árabe: comparación de las recetas de El Libro de las Medicinas (siríaco) con recetas en la literatura farmacéutica árabe, Buenos Aires 2017 (PhD dissertation); S. BHAYRO, S.M. RUDOLF, Budge's Syriac Book of Medicines after One

from the book 2 of Galen's treatise *De compositione medicamentorum per genera*, where it receives the name Βάρβαρος "Ηρα (*Barbaros Hera*, ed. Kühn, 13.557– 560)², although possibly Ἄλλη ἕναιμος³ Ιουλιανοῦ too ("Other *enaimos* by Iulianus", ed. Kühn, 13.557). Years later, the same compound appeared again in the Greek writings of renowned physicians from the Late Antiquity period, who gave it different designations, not varying considerably from the mentioned name. Oribasius calls it Βάρβαρος ἕναιμος (*Barbaros enaimos*) in *Eclogae medicamentorum*, 87, 7, 1–9 (ed. Raeder, 6.2.2.264)⁴, Aetius of Amida distinguishes it as Ἡρᾶ Kαππάδοκος βάρβαρος ("*Barbaros* Cappadocian *Hera*⁵") in *Iatricorum* liber XV, 14, 30–45 (ed. Zervos, p. 7–138)⁶, and Paul of Aegina uses the name Βαρβάρα ἕναιμος (*Barbara enaimos*) in *Epitomae medicae* 7, 17, 42, 1 (ed. Heiberg, 7.358)⁷. The author of *The Book of Medicines* also transmit a Syriac recipe (chapter 8, ed. Budge I, p. 152–153; II, p. 165–166) similar to the Greek formulae⁸, which

⁴ Oribasii Collectionum medicarum reliquiae, libri XLIX-L, libri incerti, eclogae medicamentorum, ed. J. RAEDER, Leipzig-Berlin 1933 [= CMG, 6.2.22] (cetera: ORIBASIUS).

⁵ Ήρᾶ Καππάδοκος ("Cappadocian *Hera*") could refer to the physician Heras of Cappadocia (1st century). Cf. P. KEYSER, G. IRBY, *The Encyclopedia of Ancient Natural Scientists. The Greek Tradition and its Many Heirs*, London 2012, p. 374.

⁶ Ἀετίου Ἀμιδηνοῦ λόγος δέκατος πέμπτος, ed. S. Zervos, Aθ 21, 1909, p. 7–138 (cetera: Aetius).

⁷ PAULUS AEGINETA, *Libri V–VII*, ed. J.L. HEIBERG, Leipzig–Berlin 1924 [= CMG, 11.2] (cetera: PAULUS).

⁸ Cf. S. BHAYRO, R. HAWLEY, G. KESSEL, P.E. PORMANN, *The Syriac Galen Palimpsest: Progress, Prospects and Problems*, JSS 58.1, 2013, p. 131–148; S. BHAYRO, S. BROCK, *The Syriac Galen Palimpsest and the Role of Syriac in the Transmission of Greek Medicine in the Orient*, BJRL 89.1, 2013, p. 25–43; S. BHAYRO, *Galen in Syriac: Rethinking Old Assumptions*, AStu 15, 2017, p. 132–154. In the Sassanid Persian Empire, through the Syriac Christians who led the *Bēt mardūtā* located in Gondēšāpur and Nisibis, a scholastic tradition developed for the teaching of medicine and theology, and a center for the translation of Greek knowledge into Syriac. These schools in Gondēšāpur and Nisibis were heirs to the Edessa "School of the Persians", and represented the Syriac tradition of receiving Greek medicine. For the School of Gondēšāpur and Nisibis, cf. G.J. REININK, *Theology and Medicine in Jundishapur: Cultural Change in the Nestorian School Tradition*, [in:] *Learned Antiquity. Scholarship and*

Hundred Years: Problems and Prospects, [in:] Mesopotamian Medicine and Magic. Studies in Honor of Markham J. Geller, ed. S.V. PANAYOTOV, L. VACÍN, Leiden 2018 [= AMD, 14], p. 116–130; D. ASA-DE, Las recetas de El Libro de las Medicinas (siríaco) y las que figuran en la literatura farmacéutica árabe: una comparación Do 34.2, 2018, p. 5–13.

² GALEN, De compositione medicamentorum per genera libri VII, [in:] Claudii Galeni opera omnia, vol. XIII, ed. C.G. KÜHN, Hildesheim 1965 (= Leipzig 1827) (cetera: GALEN, De compositione medicamentorum per genera).

³ According to F. RODRÍGUEZ ADRADOS et al., *Diccionario Griego-Español*, Madrid 2020, http://dge. cchs.csic.es/xdge/, ἕναιμος has the medical meaning of "full of blood". For its part, the singular neuter noun, τὸ ἕναιμος, has the meaning of "part of the body that contains blood". The term ἕναιμος also denotes the idea of "hemostatic, which serves to staunch the blood", as a φάρμακον (cf. *Pedanii Dioscuridis Anazarbei de materia medica libri quinque*, 5, 13, 1, vol. I–III, ed. M. WELLMANN, Berlin 1907–1914 (cetera: DIOSCORIDES)), and of "hemostatic medicine". Finally, its use refers to the "bleeding" and to "bleeding wounds" (cf. DIOSCORIDES, 1, 110, 2).

retains most of the ingredients noted down by the previous authors, while adding others and radically changing the name given by the Greek texts. Instead of reflecting the exact way in which the name of the prescription is rendered in its original Greek language, the anonymous author of this work record the compound with the words: منه محمد منه منه منه منه منه ("Another [plaster مالي منه), which is called the "Twelve", after the Twelve Apostles" (Fols. 73b-74a, ed. Budge I, p. 152–153), possibly reflecting the Syriac Christians as the first physicians to Christianize the name of the prescription, as can be deduced from the dating of *The Book of Medicines*.

From the references found in *The Book of Medicines*, E.A.W. Budge proposed that the Hippocratic section of this Syriac book⁹, containing the "Apostles' Ointment"

⁹ E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines 1...*, p. 159–160. *The Book of Medicines* has three main sections: a) a section of medical prescriptions that, according to E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines I...*, p. 5–13, it is based on Hippocratic medicine, and is divided into XXIII chapters, missing chapters I, II and XXIV, absent in the original manuscript. For Hippocratic medicine, also called Classical or Scientific, cf. O. TEMKIN, *Galenism. Rise and Decline of Medical Philosophy*, Ithaca 1973, and V. NUTTON, *Ancient Medicine*, London 2004; b) an astrology section, which is not within our competence, although we know that it was used to diagnose and know the right time to prescribe a medicine. This section has been studied independently. Cf. S. RUDOLF, *Syrische Astrologie und das syrische Medizinbuch*, Berlin 2018 [= STMAC, 7]; c) a section of native medical prescriptions, which is not within our competence for our objective, since, according to our criteria, it does not have important connections with Greek medicine, and that we could classify as empirical and magical. According to E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines I...*, p. 167, this section was reserved for the ignorant and credulous.

Society in the Near-East, the Greco-Roman World, and the Early Medieval West, ed. G.J. REININK, A.A. MACDONALD, M.W. TWOMEY, Leuven-Paris-Sterling 2003, p. 163-174; P. UBIERNA, Las humanidades. Notas para una historia institucional, Buenos Aires 2016, p. 33-44. Indeed, in the 6th century there was already a predominantly Christian intellectual movement that expressed itself in the Syriac language, being Sergius of Rēš'aynā (ca. 536 d.C.), the first translator of Galen's works. Cf. P. UBIERNA, Las humanidades..., p. 36-37. For the life and works of Sergius, cf. S. BROCK, Sergios of Resh'aina, [in:] Gorgias Encyclopedic Dictionary of the Syriac Heritage, ed. S.P. BROCK, A.M. BUTTS, G.A. KIRAZ, L. VAN ROMPAY, Piscataway 2011, p. 366. The oldest ms (MS BL Add 14661) dates from this period, and its authorship is linked to Sergius. This ms is a Syriac version of books 6, 7 and 8 of Galen's De simplicium medicamentorum; each drug contains the Greek name transliterated into Syriac, and also a Syriac comment. Cf. S. BHAYRO, Syriac Medical Terminology: Sergius and Galen's Pharmacopia, AStu 3.2, 2005, p. 147-165; I. CALÁ, R. HAWLEY, Transliteration versus Translation of Greek Plant Names in the Syriac Medical Writings of Sergius of Reš 'Aynā: On the Tables of Contents in BL Add. 14,661, AStu 15.2, 2017, p. 155-182. In this way, before the arrival of Islam, Greek pharmaceutical science was already documented in Syriac, having on certain occasions acquired a new meaning in accordance with Christian standards. Cf. S. BHAYRO, Galen in Syriac..., p. 140. Just in the 9th century, Hunayn ibn Ishāq, a Nestorian Christian serving in the Abbasid Islamic court, aggiornò the Syriac translations of Sergius for the Syriac readers, and also by means of more idiomatic translations, with the aim of translating them later into Arabic. Cf. E.G. BROWNE, Arabian Medicine. Being the Fitz Patrick Lectures Delivered at the College of Physicians in November 1919 and November 1920, Cambridge 1921; D. ASADE, E. GREIF, Literatura farmacéutica en el mundo oriental medieval: la recuperación árabe del Libro de las Medicinas en lengua siríaca, SMed 12.1, 2019, p. 53–90. ⁹ E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines I...*, p. 159–160. *The Book of Medicines* has three main sections:

and other prescriptions¹⁰ possibly based on Greek medical works, is a translation into Syriac of the lectures of an Alexandrian teacher¹¹ (6th century), carried out by a Syriac doctor associated with one of the great Syriac Medical Schools of the first centuries of the Christian era¹². However, E.A.W. Budge's thesis received different opinions from later scholars. M. Meyerhof, for example, also argued that the author may have been Ahrun, a Jacobite-Christian physician and priest, who taught in Alexandria during the 6th century¹³, and whose work *Pandecte* was translated into Syriac by Gesios¹⁴ and, from there, into Arabic by Māsarjawayh, under the name *Kunnaš*¹⁵. Another argument in favor of placing the Syriac work in the Late Antiquity or Early Islamic period is that of P. Gignoux, who observed that, in the text, there are medical terms and names of prescriptions in the Pahlavi language¹⁶ transliterated into Syriac, and who argued that some of these prescriptions

¹⁰ "Hiera of Logadios", "Hiera of Archigenes", "Hiera of Galen", "Hiera of Theodoretus", "Hiera Picra", etc. Cf. E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines II…*, p. 47–53.

¹¹ The author of *The Book of Medicines* says: Now when I was in Alexandria, a certain villager was bitten by an asp in one of the fingers of his hand when he was at no very great distance from the city. Immediately he tied round the lowest joint of his finger, which was close to the palm of his hand, a strong bandage, and ran straightway to a certain physician whom he know at the gate of the city, and entreated him to cut off his finger from the lowest joint, namely that which was in the palm of his hand. He expected that if this could be done he would suffer no [further] injury, and his expectation was fulfilled as he thought it would be, for he was saved, and lived, and this only did he seek (cf. translation E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines II...*, p. 25). According to E.A.W. BUDGE, the author mentions a case of the use of the "tour- niquet", and another case of a man who was bitten by a viper, and who was saved by cutting off the joint that had been bitten, presumably in the neighbourhood of Alexandria, and it seems that he made note of these cases, as physicians do.

¹² E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines I...*, p. 5, 159–160, adds that those schools could have been those of *Edessa (Urfa) and Amid (Diarbekir), and Nisibis.* On the medical schools of Syriac tradition, cf. E.R. *L'École d'Édesse*, Paris 1930; A.H. BECKER, *Fear of God and the Beginning of Wisdom. The School of Nisibis and the Development of Scholastic Culture in Late Antique Mesopotamia*, Philadelphia 2006 [= D.RLAR]; C.R. LE COZ, *Les chrétiens dans la médecine arabe*, Paris 2006, p. XLIV, who suggests that the translation is from the 4th century: *Selon lui, il s'agirait de la traduction des leçons d'un professeur d'Alexandrie du IV*° siècle effectuée par un professeur de Nisibe [...].

¹³ M. MEYERHOF, Die Augenheilkunde in der von Budge herausgegebenen syrischen ärztlichen Handschrift, DI 6, 1916, p. 257–268. According to K. SAMIR, Ahrun Ibn A'yan Al-Qass, vol. I, New York 1991, Ahrun would have lived in the 6th century, or the late 7th and early 8th centuries. Both the Greek text and its Syriac translation were lost, although some extracts survived in al-Razi's medical encyclopedia (865–925) entitled *al-Hawi*. On the Jacobites, cf. C. SÉLIS, *Les Syriens Orthodoxes et Catholiques*, Belgique 1988, and on the Nestorians, cf. H.G.B. TEULE, *Les Assyro-Chaldéens. Chrétiens d'Iran, d'Iran et de Turquie*, Turnhout 2008.

¹⁴ Gesios was a native of Petra, of a Jacobite Christian religious denomination (late 5th and early 6th centuries). Cf. C.R. LE Coz, *Les chrétiens...*, p. 59–61.

¹⁵ C.R. LE Coz, Les médecins nestoriens au Moyen-Âge. Les maîtres des Arabes (Comprendre le Moyen-Orient), Paris 2004, p. 80; K. SAMIR, Ahrun Ibn A'yan Al-Qass..., doubts who made the Arabic translation.

¹⁶ P. GIGNOUX, Le traité syriaque anonyme sur les medications, [in:] Symposium Syriacum VII: Uppsala University, Department of Asian and African Languages, 11–14 August 1996, ed. R. LAVENANT, ROME

had circulated before Pahlavi disappeared completely¹⁷ during the Abbasid period¹⁸. C.R. Le Coz also agrees with E.A.W. Budge's thesis and, as M. Meyerhof does, claims that the author of *The Book of Medicines* could have been a "Jacobite" Christian¹⁹. S. Bhayro, on the contrary, argues forcefully against the thesis put forward by E.A.W. Budge in the early 20th century. First, he considers that the work is hardly a possible translation or a Greek lesson²⁰ in the following terms:

Budge is correct in that his manuscript does indeed contain much Greek science in Syriac translation. Furthermore, it is indeed likely to be a Nestorian scholarly text. But the way in which the Greek science has been received within the text, with its careful ordering of earlier known medical material in abridged form, coupled with the wealth of non-Greco-Roman medical lore, suggests that this is not a translation of Greek medical work or series of lectures into Syriac. Rather, it is a compendium based on a combination of Greco-Roman and Mesopotamian sources.

Then, he elaborates on the idea:

This very much contrasts with the approach of earlier translators such as the sixth-century Sergius and the ninth-century Hunayn. The need for such an easy to use, practical medical handbook may have been a major motivation in the production of the BoM, but another factor may have been the wider intellectual context of the 12th century²¹ – the so-called Syriac Renaissance²², which saw a flourishing of Syriac intellectual activity between the 11th and 13th centuries²³.

P.E. Pormann and E. Savage-Smith, on the other hand, did not dare to propose a dating and made a description of the text, which falls somewhere in between E.A.W. Budge's and S. Bhayro's proposals, as follows:

^{1998 [=} OCA, 256], p. 727. The name of the recipe in Syriac character *gwgršn šhryr*'n is meaningless. However, if those same characters are read in the Pahlavi language as *gugārišn šahryārān*, can be translated as "real digestive". The Pahlavi language, also called Middle Persian, was the official language of the Sassanid Empire (226–651), but it survived until the 9th century.

¹⁷ P. GIGNOUX, *Lexique des termes de la pharmacopée Syriaque*, Paris 2011, p. 7–8.

¹⁸ On the Abbasid period (ca. 750–1259), especially the Translation Movement, cf. D. GUTAS, *Greek Thought, Arabic Culture. The Graeco-Arabic Translation Movement in Baghdad and Early 'Abbāsid Society (2nd-4th/8th-10th Centuries), London 1998.*

¹⁹ C.R. LE Coz, *Les médecins*..., p. 44; IDEM, *Les chrétiens*..., p. 61, 179, where he argues that he was a "Jacobite" Christian, since these were the only ones who could study in Alexandria, implicitly admitting that the Nestorians were prohibited from entering Byzantine territory.

²⁰ S. BHAYRO, The Reception of Galen's Art of Medicine in the Syriac Book of Medicines, [in:] Medical Books in the Byzantine World, ed. B. ZIPSER, Bologna 2013, p. 127.

²¹ Cf. *ibidem*, p. 126.

²² On the so-called Syriac Renaissance, cf. H.G.B. TEULE, C. FOTESCU TAUWINKL, R.B. TER HAAR ROMENY, J.J. VAN GINKEL, *The Syriac Renaissance*, Leuven–Walpole 2010 [= ECS, 9].

²³ S. BHAYRO, *Theory and Practice...*, p. 156.

Much mistery sorrounds it: different scholars have speculated when it might have been written, with suggestions running from the sixth to the thirteenth centuries. Whatever the moment of the final compilation, it is evident that this text contains much material dating back to the sixth and seventh centuries²⁴.

Finally, Grigory Kessel, after having consulted him about the dating of *The Book of Medicines*, concludes:

Nobody knows for sure when that text was composed. But even if it was written, let's say, at the 9th century (one of the hypothesis) it nevertheless relies and uses material that goes back to the Greek sources of the $2^{nd}-6^{th}$.

One part of *The Book of Medicines* deals with medical recipes and it may be an original Syriac text²⁵.

Without a univocal consensus yet, we propose a dating for the "Apostles' Ointment" by means of a philological-comparative study, thus avoiding a single dating for all the prescriptions in *The Book of Medicines*, whose content and authorship(s) have not yet been fully studied. The philological analysis we have embraced consists of examining the term used for each simple drug appearing in the formula of our plaster, in comparison with the Syriac nomenclature of varied etymology²⁶, noted in MS BL Add 14661 by Sergius (6th century)²⁷, *Syriac Lexicon* by Bar Bahlul (10th century)²⁸, and *Le candélabre des sanctuaires* by Bar Hebraeus (13th century)²⁹. Thus, when the terms of the prescription are traced in these works and the philo-

²⁴ P.E. PORMANN, E. SAVAGE-SMITH, Medieval Islamic Medicine, Washington D.C. 2007, p. 19.

²⁵ G. KESSEL bases his answer on R. DEGEN, *Ein Corpus Medicorum Syriacorum*, MJou 7.1–2, 1972, p. 114–122, esp. at p. 118 n. 21. Another survey can be found in S. Rudolf, *Syrische Astrologie…*, p. 107–108.

²⁶ The Syriac nomenclature used for the simple medicines present in a certain medical prescription can generally be of Semitic, Persian or Greek etymology. As Semitic terms tend to remain unchanged over time, unlike the different ways of transliterating them into Syriac from Greek, it is convenient to take the latter into account for philological analysis, since it is likely to be found in different ways depending on the dating the source.

 ²⁷ This is the Syriac translation of books 6, 7 and 8 of Galen's *De simplicium medicamentorum temperamentis ac facultatibus*. A. MERX, *Proben der syrischen Uebersetzung von Galenus' Schrift über die einfachen Heilmittel*, ZDMG 39.2, 1885, p. 237–305, edited only the alphabetical list of medicinal plants.
²⁸ H. BAR BAHLUL, R. DUVAL, *Lexicon Syriacum*, Paris 1901.

²⁹ It has a list of medicinal plants, *A List of Plants and their Properties from the Menârath kudhsê of Gregorius Bar 'Ebhrâya*, ed. R.J.H. GOTTHEIL, [s.l.] 1886, edited from ms. Sachau 81, later corrected, R.J.H. GOTTHEIL, *Berichtungen und Zusätze zu "A List of Plants"*, ZDMG 43, 1889, p. 121–127. The first critical edition is *Le candélabre des Sanctuaires de Grégoire Aboulfaradj dit Barhebraeus*, ed. et trans. J. BAKOŠ, Paris 1933 [= *PO*, 24] (cetera: GRÉGOIRE ABOULFARADJ DIT BARHEBRAEUS), p. 229–439. Finally, this pharmaceutical list was studied by H. TAKAHASHI within the framework of the European project Floriental (ERC-2010- StG-263783, Floriental, dir. R. HAWLEY), cf. S. BHAY-RO, R. HAWLEY, *La littérature botanique et pharmaceutique en langue syriaque*, [in:] *Les sciences en syriaque*, ed. E. VILLEY, Paris 2014 [= ESyr, 11], p. 285–318.

logical analysis is carried out on the Syriac transliterations of the signs of the Greek writing system, we observe differences in the words according to the time of representation. In the case of the drugs from the "Apostles' Ointment" present in the three works mentioned above, the analysis of some products deriving from medicinal plants³⁰ – bdellium³¹, resin³², wax³³, galbanum³⁴, opopanax³⁵ – yields the following result:

Greek	The Book of Medicines	MS BL Add 14661	Syriac Lexicon	Le candélabre
βδέλλιον ³⁶	رمداه	37 COKT 22	38 organ	Not found
πίσσα ³⁹	لاتولى	⁴⁰ ~uh~i	⁴¹ ~Jmi	42 miles i
κηρός ⁴³	Цран	⁴⁴ ∞من≺ם	⁴⁵ ≺hoi¤	Not found

³⁰ MS BL Add 14661 and the section "des plantes" in Grégoire Aboulfaradj dit Barhebraeus, p. 229–439, only mention herbal medicines.

³⁵ معدمه , cf. E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines I*..., p. 152, 20.

³⁶ Dioscorides, 1, 67.

³⁹ GALEN, *De compositione medicamentorum per genera*, VII, 2, 22 (ed. KÜHN, 13.557–561); ORIBA-SIUS, 87, 7, 1–9 (ed. RAEDER, 6.2.2.264); AETIUS, XV, 14, 20–46 (ed. ZERVOS, P. 7–138); PAULUS, 7.17 (ed. HEIBERG, 7.358).

⁴⁰ Cf. BL Add 14661 f.56v29.

⁴¹ Cf. H. BAR BAHLUL, R. DUVAL, *Lexicon...*, p. 1877.

⁴² Cf. Grégoire Aboulfaradj dit Barhebraeus, p. 346.

⁴³ GALEN, *De compositione medicamentorum per genera*, VII, 2, 22 (ed. KÜHN, 13.557–561); ORIBA-SIUS, 87, 7, 1–9 (ed. RAEDER, 6.2.2.264); AETIUS, XV, 14, 20–46 (ed. ZERVOS, P. 7–138); PAULUS, 7.17 (ed. HEIBERG, 7.358).

44 Cf. BL Add 14661 f.33v3.

⁴⁵ Cf. H. BAR BAHLUL, R. DUVAL, *Lexicon...*, p. 1838.

⁴⁶ GALEN, *De compositione medicamentorum per genera*, VII, 2, 22 (ed. Kühn, 13.557–561); ORIBA-SIUS, 87, 7, 1–9 (ed. RAEDER, 6.2.2.264).

⁴⁷ Cf. BL Add 14661 f.57r1.

⁴⁸ Cf. H. BAR BAHLUL, R. DUVAL, *Lexicon...*, p. 894.

⁴⁹ Cf. Grégoire Aboulfaradj dit Barhebraeus, p. 336.

⁵⁰ GALEN, *De compositione medicamentorum per genera*, VII, 2, 22 (ed. Kühn, 13.557–561); ORIBA-SIUS, 87, 7, 1–9 (ed. RAEDER, 6.2.2.264); AETIUS, XV, 14, 20–46 (ed. ZERVOS, p. 7–138); PAULUS, 7.17 (ed. HEIBERG, 7.358).

⁵¹ Cf. BL Add 14661 f.60v6.

⁵² Cf. H. BAR BAHLUL, R. DUVAL, *Lexicon...*, p. 894.

⁵³ Cf. Grégoire Aboulfaradj dit Barhebraeus, p. 335–336.

³¹ , cf. E.A.W. BUDGE, The Book of Medicines I..., p. 152, 18.

³² Kinni, cf. E.A.W. BUDGE, The Book of Medicines I..., p. 152, 18.

³³, Khoin cf. E.A.W. BUDGE, The Book of Medicines I..., p. 152, 18.

³⁴ , حلحته, cf. E.A.W. Budge, *The Book of Medicines I*..., p. 152, 19.

³⁷ Cf. BL Add 14661 f.4r5.

³⁸ Cf. H. BAR BAHLUL, R. DUVAL, *Lexicon...*, p. 358.

Greek	The Book of Medicines	MS BL Add 14661	Syriac Lexicon	Le candélabre
χαλβάνη ⁴⁶	طحتم	⁴⁷ محالحه	48 ملدنه	⁴⁹ µ~
όποπάναξ⁵⁰	مصععد	□□□~موبجو 51	⁵² ∞مפוםאס≺	⁵³ യപ്പെപ്പുക്കപ്പെ

Although not all the terms appear in the three works, the comparative study from the table above leads us to suggest that the Syriac formulation of the "Apostles' Ointment" dates from the Abbasid period⁵⁴, since simple medicines are

مر هم الرسل: وهو دشليحا أي مر هم الحواريين ويعرف بمر هم الز هر ة وبمر هم منديا و هو مر هم يصلح بالرفق النواصير الصعبة والخنازير الصعبة ليس شيء مثله وينقي الجر احات من اللحم الميت والقيح ويدمل يقال أنه إثنا عشر دواء لاثني عشر حواريا. اخلاطه: يؤخذ شمع ابيض وراتينج من كل واحد ثمانية و عشرون در هما جاوشير وزنجار من كل واحد أربعه در اهم أشق وزن اربعة عشر در هما زر اوند طويل وكندر ذكر من كل واحد وزن ستة دراهم مر وقنة من كل واحد اربعة در اهم مقل وزن ستة در اهم مرداسنج وزن تسعة دراهم ينقع

As read here, the qualitative composition of Avicenna's recipe has thirteen simple medications – wax, resin, long aristoloquia, frankincense, litharge, bdellium, opopanax, verdigris, gum ammoniac, galbanum, vinegar, pitch, myrrh. F. PUCCINOTTI, *Storia della medicina*, vol. II, *Medicina del Medio Evo*, pars 2, Livorno 1859, p. 709, says that *item aliud quod commendat Avicenna appellatur unguentum xii Apostolorum: alii appellant unguentum Veneris*, that rectificat fistulas dissimiles et serofulas parvas, et mundificat vulnera a carne mortua, mundificata primo post consolidat. Later, G. KEIL, Zur Datierung des 'Antidotarium Nicolai', SAr 62, 1978, p. 193, n. 33, argues that the "unguentum apostolorum"

⁵⁴ The Christianization of the name of the Greek recipe for Apostles' Ointment by the Syriacs of late Antiquity is opposed to the thesis transmitted during modern times that attributes the assignment of Apostles' Ointment to the Arabs. In Arabic it appears for the first time in the Dispensatorium Parvum (al-Aqrābādhīn al-saghīr), ed. O. KAHL, Leiden 1994 [= IPTS.TS, 16] (9th century CE) with the name مرهم الرسل, "Apostle's Ointment", mentioning twelve ingredients. Cf. O. KAHL, Dispensatorium Parvum..., p. 206. SABŪR was a Nestorian Syriac Christian physician from southeastern Iran who was educated at the Gundishapur School and practiced medicine there, until he was appointed court physician by the 'Abbāsid caliph al-Mutawakkil. For its part, in the book known as al-Qānūn fī altibb, Bulaq, al-Matba'ah al-'Āmirah 1878 (cetera: AVICENNA), AVICENNA incorporates in Arabic a recipe of Greek-Syriac origin in the eleventh century, which names مرهم الرسل: وهو دشليحا أي مرهم (Apostles ointment is that of dšlyh', that is, apostles ointment, الحواريين ويعرف بمرهم الزهرة وبمرهم منديا and [also] known as Venus ointment, and mndyā ointment [...], AVICENNA, 5, 405). In the name of the recipe we find that the word مثليه مشليه dšlyh', which is meaningless in Arabic, is transliterated from the Syriac معلمه, and it means "of the apostles". Cf. معلمديم, J.P.S. MARGOLIOUTH, S.R. PAYNE, A Compendious Syriac Dictionary. Founded upon the Thesaurus Syriacus, Oxford 1903, p. 580. AVICENNA might not know the Syriac language, so he chooses to transliterate instead of translating الحواريين, al-ḥawāriyīna, another Arabic term for "apostles". Cf. حور, R.P.A. Dozy, Supplément aux dictionnaires arabes, vol. I, Leiden 1927. At the same time, the word منديا, mndyā, which does not make sense in Arabic either, is perhaps transliterated from the Syriac , which means "be disperesed" (cf. H. BAR BAHLUL, R. DUVAL, Lexicon..., p. 1104), a term that could be associated with an ointment. As for the complete recipe, AVICENNA indicates:

already transliterated in Syriac from Greek in the *Syriac Lexicon* (10th century) the same way that *The Book of Medicines*, while they are mentioned differently in the other two sources⁵⁵ (when they appear). This allows us to propose that, at least during the Abbasid period, a Syriac version of the Greek prescriptions existed, with a name Christianizing for the first time. The Syriac author called this new version of the prescription Bápβapoç "Hpa o ἔναιμος "Apostles' Ointment", slightly modifying its composition and therapeutic indications. The analysis of the therapeutic uses of the Syriac prescription, in addition to its qualitative composition, in comparison with the plasters of Galen, Oribasius, Aetius of Amida and Paul of Aegina, will allow us to investigate these micro-transformations introduced by the Syriac physicians in the "Apostles' Ointment", as we will demonstrate in the following sections.

The "Apostles' Ointment" from The Book of Medicines

In chapter 8 from *The Book of Medicines* (Fols. 53a–74a), there is a section on plasters for the therapeutic treatment of nerve injuries (Fols. 72b-74a)⁵⁶. According to the author, when the nerves receive a strong blow or become inflamed because of an abscess, or when they are stabbed, crushed, cut or they become ill from the bite of an animal, they need warm and delicate medicines. He recommends warming by means of sweet oil without astringent properties and, especially, the application of plasters, whose therapeutic action, composition and preparation is detailed in a section about several pharmaceutical plasters, formed with fats and substances with different active principles, suitable for their application in wounds. In addition, he names a total of five prescriptions, which are detailed below: 1) "Plaster (or, liniments) of euphorbium which are good for the wounds that take place in the nerves, and for the bites of evil beasts" (Fol. 73a); 2) "Another unguent of euphorbium which is good for wounds of the nerves, and for abscesses of all kinds which are caused by colds and chills, and for wounds caused by evil beasts" (Fol. 73a); 3) "Another unguent of opopanax and vinegar which is to be used for the wounds that come in the nerves, and for the bites of a mad dog" (Fol. 73a); 4) "Another, a musk fillet" (Fol. 73b), which is used a) "for the cutting of the nerves", b) "for injuries of the nerves even if they are cut or crushed", c) "for the sores that are produced by breaking of bones", d) "for the collection of water", e) "for the constriction, and for abscesses in the anus"; 5) "Another [unguent] which is called the "Persian", and which is used for pains" (Fol. 73b). Within this group, he includes

is the "Zwölfbotensalbe" of AVICENNA, 5, 405, *die durch die zweite Rezeptionswelle des Arabismus dem Abendland bekannt wurde.*

⁵⁵ This method is valid assuming that the sources are complete in terms of the terminology used in the corresponding periods.

⁵⁶ E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines I...*, p. 152–153.

a sixth plaster, which he calls "Another [plaster \sim_{2}]⁵⁷, which is called⁵⁸ the "Twelve", after the Twelve Apostles" (Fols. 73b–74a, ed. Budge I, p. 152–153; II, p. 165–166). The author does not explain why he decided to give the plaster this name. He only says it is related to the "call [of the] twelve, in reference to the Twelve Apostles". Because of this denomination, we consider that it was possibly a popular name at the time, perhaps known prior to the annotation in *The Book of Medicines* and related to the "Twelve Apostles", who were Jesus' followers. Nor does he mention the word "plaster", \sim_{2} ; instead, he uses the term "other", followed by a long list of therapeutic applications:

איניאה ובכלסיא לי שמילא אר שב אד לי שביאי שליעאי: ועשעיא אבאמי בעיטולא אר שביע לי שביאי נדמסי בגריאי. מכבר סובי, מדיכבא שיביעא משיאי. מדורמאי שביאי מדיעאי. מדשיאי לשמעיא שינאיאי ומיטיאי בדיביאי. מלבאיב משיטוליא ודמיטיא בדיביאי: Another [plaster] which is called the Twelve, after the Twelve Apostles, and which is useful for all difficult wounds, which come in the nerves and in every member. It is emollient for hard abscesses and dense secretions of viscous pus, and dissolves scrofula, and dissipates cancers, and emollient for sores, and helps old ulcers, and pain in the ears, and boils in the nostrils, and the severe pain which comes in the womb.

He then lists the drugs in the prescription and the quantities of each drug:

בסידאי. הו. אמלידאי. אדיינעים ה. בוולעים ה. בעו. בעו. מסלידאי ויחלדאי. סיסוראי. עוד. עוד. ווו. אידה. ברבאי. בעוע. בעוע. דיסיאי. מפעסים. עוע. עוגי ברבאי. בעוע. בסולאי מדא לעליאי. הבסורה לעליאי הבעלים ל litharge 30 *estire*⁵⁹ gum ammoniac 7 bdellium 7 resin 16 drachms wax 16 verdigris 9 galbanum 9 myrrh 8 opopanax 8 aloes 12 frankincense 12 birthwort (long) 12 olive oil (in the summer) 1 litra⁶⁰ olive oil (in the winter) 1,5.

⁵⁷ The translation is direct from Syriac and was made by D. ASADE from the edition of E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines I...*, p. 152–153. Cf. translation by E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines II...*, p. 165–166, who uses the term "unguent" instead of "plaster", "spum of silver" instead of "litharge", "cinnabar" instead of "verdigris".

⁵⁸ תיראםי, "call", cf. Mt 1: 16.

⁵⁹ Cf. حمدانة, M. SOKOLOFF, C. BROCKELMANN, A Syriac Lexicon. A Translation from the Latin. Correction, Expansion, and Update of C. Brockelmann's Lexicon Syriacum, Winona Lake 2009, p. 80; E.A.W. BUDGE, The Book of Medicines II..., p. 526.

⁶⁰ The *litra* containes twenty *estire* (i.e. 100 drachms).

As can be observed, the Syriac prescription totals fourteen medicines, including drugs of animal, vegetable and mineral origin. He mentions wax, which is the animal excipient par excellence to give consistency to the preparation. He also adds mineral drugs, such as litharge⁶¹, and verdigris⁶², which chemically are lead monoxide and cupric acetate respectively, both responsible for the healing and astringent action. Herbal drugs, myrrh, aloe⁶³, and frankincense⁶⁴, serve the same function. In addition, both gum ammoniac⁶⁵ and galbanum⁶⁶ can absorb gumresin, bdellium, which is an oleo-gum-resin, used as an emollient⁶⁷, the resin is adhesive and aromatic⁶⁸, and the opopanax, used to treat ulcers, the bite of rabid dogs and to heal various wounds⁶⁹, is also added as an aromatic⁷⁰. Vinegar is also included in the Syriac prescription and has a twofold action: it is part of the production process, providing an acid medium for the gums to retain their adhesive properties, and it is used to stop the bleeding⁷¹. Finally, olive oil, which is the vehicle or excipient, makes it possible to contain the rest of the active substances. This oily vehicle, together with the wax, besides having occlusive and emollient properties, has the purpose of dissolving pharmacologically active oily substances, while the minerals are dispersed in this vehicle until they form a paste.

The fourteen ingredients from the prescription, then, are basic substances with a broad spectrum of use in drug production. Each plaster ingredient serves a particular function as a binder, healing, astringent, absorbent, emollient, adhesive and even aromatic agent. However, the pharmaceutical art required not only knowledge of the properties of the basic substances, but also an indication of the correct elaboration process in order to obtain an effective medicine, which the Syriac prescription details in these terms:

⁶¹ Cf. λιθάργυρος, Dioscorides, 5, 87. On the toxicity of its absorption, cf. J.B. Leikin, F.P. Paloucek, *Poisoning and Toxicology Handbook*, Boca Raton 2008, p. 807.

⁶² Cf. DIOSCORIDES, 5, 88. On its irritant capacity for the skin, cf. J.B. LEIKIN, F.P. PALOUCEK, *Poisoning and Toxicology...*, p. 779.

⁶³ Cf. DIOSCORIDES, 3, 22. On its antiseptic properties, cf. J.A. DUKE, *Handbook of Medicinal Herbs*, ²Boca Raton 2002, p. 15.

⁶⁴ Cf. DIOSCORIDES, 1, 68. On its anti-inflammatory properties, J.A. DUKE, *Handbook...*, p. 15.

⁶⁵ Cf. DIOSCORIDES, 3, 84. Cf. W.C. EVANS, G.E. TREASE, D. EVANS, *Trease and Evans' Pharmacognosy*, Edinburgh 2002, p. 31.

⁶⁶ Cf. Dioscorides, 3, 83. Cf. W.C. Evans, G.E. Trease, D. Evans, *Trease and*..., p. 31.

⁶⁷ Cf. DIOSCORIDES, 1, 67. Cf. J.A. DUKE, *Handbook...*, p. 360.

⁶⁸ In this regard, the different resins mentioned by DIOSCORIDES can be consulted in *De materia medica*, 1, 71, 3–4. On its antimicrobial activity, cf. J.A. DUKE, *Handbook*..., p. 282.

⁶⁹ Cf. Dioscorides, 3, 48.

⁷⁰ Cf. Dioscorides, 3, 48.

⁷¹ Cf. Dioscorides, 5, 13.

דסם הדדבא חשעהם. הך אודא שלהה, השעא סעל. השעהם סעל שדדא דמהא איקה איסטרעאי הק של של גמהא דמשאוא החהא הק של של גמדאי. שדרא דמשאוא החהא איקה דבשאי האוליא החשם. הביאי האבטעאי. איס בעלה, השעה הילי השלה שלה האוליודי עליא דין לבשהאי דלא שהכעיאי: הדלא בארא העשאי. האסטא לחין. Pound the litharge and beat it to a powder, then pour a little oil upon it, and crush it again until it becomes like a plaster, and boil it over a fire until it dissolves and becomes like honey. Then incorporate the gum ammoniac⁷² and myrrh and frankincense and opopanax and bdellium in vinegar, and work them up together until they are dissolved. Then grind verdigris, aloes, and birthwort and pour on the mixture, and work up and use for the pains which have been described. It will keep the wounds free from abscesses, and free from pain and disease, and will heal them.

This pharmacotechnical process is logical according to current pharmacy knowledge. The first step consists of forming a paste between a powder (litharge) and an oily element (oil). In addition, heat has the function of reducing the viscosity of the paste, facilitating its manipulation. At the same time, the gomorresins from the medicinal plants (gum ammoniac, myrrh, franckincese, opopanax and bdellium) are dissolved in vinegar. Finally, the remaining ingredients (verdigris, aloe, and birthwort) are incorporated, in a ground form, to the mixture of the first two steps. In this last part of the prescription, the author also gives some general advice regarding the relationship between the formulation, the therapeutic indications and the season of the year in which it is appropriate to treat certain pathologies, as well as recent and old wounds. Therefore, he claims it is useful for long-lasting ulcers, ear pain, infections in the nostrils and pain in the abdomen, possibly caused by some superficial infection. At the same time, he indicates its application for deep wounds, which involve nerves in different parts of the body and which can become infected.

The author ceases his exposition of the prescription "Apostles' Ointment" here, after giving precise instructions on the composition formula of the plaster, including the drugs involved in it and their quantities, the way to elaborate it and its application. Now, the Greek medical texts of the Antiquity and Late Antiquity period refer to a plaster with characteristics similar to those mentioned in the Syriac prescription, which could be the sources of that version.

⁷² E.A.W. BUDGE, *The Book of Medicines II*..., p. 165, seems not to recognize the term 22007, and transliterates *hoshaq*. This is the Syriac name for gum ammoniac, cf. M. SOKOLOFF, C. BROCKEL-MANN, *A Syriac Lexicon*..., p. 339.

The Ἄλλη ἔναιμος Ἰουλιανοῦ and Βάρβαρος Ἡρα by Galen

In chapter 22 (ed. Kühn, 13.555–561), from the book 2 of Galen's treatise *De compositione medicamentorum per genera* (ed. Kühn, 13.458–561), which integrates Galen's treatise *De compositione medicamentorum per genera libri VII*, four plasters are included: 1) Ai δι' ἀσφάλτου βάρβαροι (ed. Kühn, 13.555–556), containing five prescriptions⁷³; 2) Βάρβαρος Γαληνοῦ (ed. Kühn, 13.560–561), including two prescriptions⁷⁴; 3) Ἄλλη ἕναιμος Ἰουλιανοῦ (ed. Kühn, 13.557); and 4) Βάρβαρος ἕΗρα

⁷⁴ Galen does not give the name of the first recipe. It only indicates its medicines and quantities: 8 litrae of pitch, 6 litrae of bees wax, 8 unciae (?), 5 litrae of pine [resin], 4 unciae (?), 4 litrae of bitumen, 1 litra of olive oil, 6 unciae (?), 24 [litrae] of litharge, white lead and vedigris, half litra of frankincense, 12 [drachmae] of liquid stypthria, 4 unciae of cleft, 12 [drachmae] of opopanax, scale [of metal], galbanum, 4 [drachmae] of aloe, opium, myrrh, 24 unciae of turpentine, 6 [drachmae] mandragora juice, 6 kotilae of vinegar (Πίσσης λίτρας η'. κηροῦ λί τρας στ'. οὐγγίας η'. πιτυΐνης λίτρας ε'. οὐγγίας δ'. ἀσφάλτου λίτρας δ'. ἐλαίου λίτραν α'. οὐγγίας στ'. λιθαργύρου καὶ ψιμυθίου καὶ ἰοῦ ἀνὰ κδ'. λιβανωτοῦ λίτρας καὶ ὀπίου καὶ σμύρνης ἀνὰ δ'. τερμινθίνης οὐγγίας κδ'. μανδραγόρου χυλοῦ στ'. ὄξους κοτύλας στ'). Galen also indicates a second recipe, which is the proportion of the simple barbaros

⁷³ The first is attributed to Andromachus. It is made up of the following medicines: 6 [drachmae] of bees wax, 6 [drachmae] of pitch, 6 [drachmae] of pine resin, 6 [drachmae] of bitumen, 24 [drachmae] of frankincense-tree, 1 [drachma] of olive oil (κηροῦ ς'. πίσσης ς'. ὑητίνης ς'. ἀσφάλτου ς'. λιβάνου κδ'. ἐλαίου κοτύλην α'. ἄλλη). The second, simply called ἄλλη, is made up of 2 litra of pitch, 1 litra of bitumen, 1 litra of bees wax, 6 of aromatic ammoniac, 6 litra of gum, 3 litra of white lead, kotyle of olive oil, 4 kotylae of vinager (πίσσης λίτρας β'. ἀσφάλτου λίτραν α'. κηροῦ λίτραν α'. ἀμμωνιακοῦ θυμιάματος γο στ'. μάννης γο στ'. ψιμυθίου γο γ'. ἐλαίου κοτύλης'. ὄξους κοτύλας δ'). The third is called "other melaina" ($\mu \epsilon \lambda \alpha \nu \alpha \lambda \lambda \eta$). It is prepared with 1 litra of dry pitch, 1 litra of dry pine resin, 1 litra of bitumen, 6 litra of white lead, 3 unciae of gum, solution of blue vitriol, copper sulphate, striped verdigris, half kotyle of olive oil, half kotyke of vinegar (π ίσσης ξηρᾶς λίτραν α'. ἡητίνης ξηρᾶς λίτραν α΄. ἀσφάλτου λίτραν α΄. ψιμυθίου γο στ΄. μάννης, χαλκάνθης, ἰοῦ ξυστοῦ ἀνὰ οὐγγίας γ΄. ἐλαίου κοτύλης ήμισυ, ὄξους κοτύλης ήμισυ). The fourth has the name "other by Gaius" (ἄλλη ἐκ τῶν Γάλλου). It contains 30 [drachmae] of goat fat, eight [drachmae] of vedigris, 50 [drachmae] of bees wax, 25 of aristolochia, 24 of bitumen, 25 [drachmae] of pitch, 12 [drachmas] of aromatic ammoniac, 12 [drachmae] of galbanum, medium (?), 8 [drachmae] of Ferula tingitana, 20 [drachmae] of another (?), 12 [drachmae] of gum (στέατος αἰγείου λ'. ἰοῦ η'. κηροῦ ν'. ἀριστολοχίας κε'. ἀσφάλτου κε'. πίσσης κε'. ἀμμωνιακοῦ θυμιάματος ιβ'. χαλβάνης ιβ'. ἤμισυ, σιλφίου η'. ἄλλ. κ'. μάννης ιβ'. σκεύαζε). The fifth is "otra llamada aniketos" (ἄλλη ή καλουμένη ἀνίκητος). Its formula is 100 [drachmae] bees wax, 30 [drachmae] of cow fat, 24 [drachmae] of bitumen, 25 [drachmae] of pitch, 25 [drachmae] of turpentine, 22 [drachmae] of sodium carbonate, medium (?), 12 [drachmae] of aristolochia, 8 [drachmae] of galbanum, 18 drachmae of myrrh, 12 [drachmae] of incense, medium (?), 8 [drachmae] of ammoniac, 8 [drachmae] of Nepaul cardamom, 12 [drachmae] of cardamum, 8 drachmae of opopanax, 15 [drachmae] of deer fat, 12 [drachmae] of vedigris, 8 drachmaes of aloe, 16 [drachmae] of bdellium, 2 kotilae of olive oil, I also add 12 drachmae of bee-glue (κηροῦ ρ'. στέατος ταυρείου λ'. ἀσφάλτου κε΄. πίσσης κε΄. τερμινθίνης κε΄. νίτρου κβ΄. ἥμισυ, ἀριστολοχίας ιβ΄. χαλβάνης η΄. Σμύρνης δραχμὰς ιη'. λιβάνου ιβ'. ἥμισυ, ἀμμωνιακοῦ δραχμὰς η'. ἀμώμου δραχμὰς η'. καρδαμώμου ιβ'. ὀποπάνακος δραχμὰς η'. μυελοῦ ἐλαφείου ιε'. ἰοῦ ιβ'. ἀλόης δραχμὰς η'. βδελλίου ιστ'. ἐλαίου κοτύλας β'. ἐγὼ δὲ ἕβαλλον προπόλεως δραχμὰς ιβ').

(ed. Kühn, 13.557–560), where the prescriptions "black *enaimos* plaster" (μέλαινα ἕμπλαστρος ἕναιμος) and "other *barbaros Hera*" (ἄλλη βάρβαρος "Ηρα). Of these four plasters, Ἄλλη ἕναιμος Ἰουλιανοῦ and Βάρβαρος "Ηρα contain formulas closely related to the Syriac prescription.

The "Other *enaimos* by Iulianus"⁷⁵ (Άλλη ἔναιμος Ἰουλιανοῦ, ed. Kühn, 13.557) is attributed to Iulianus (of Alexandria) (ca. 140–160 CE). Galen would have met this Methodist physician sometime during his stay in Alexandria, as J. Scarborough⁷⁶ infers, and passed on the drugs in his prescription, composed as follows:

λιθαργύρου ν'. ἀσφάλτου δραχμὰς ν'. κηροῦ ν'. πίσσης βρυτίας δραχμὰς ν'. ἑητίνης φρυκτῆς ιε'. λεπίδος χαλκοῦ ιβ'. λιβάνου δραχμὰς ιδ'. χαλβάνης η'. χαλκίτεως δραχμὰς δ'. ἀλόης στ'. κηκίδος δ'. σμύρνης δραχμὰς δ'. ἀριστολοχίας μακρᾶς στ'. ἀριστολοχίας στρογγύλης δραχμὰς δ'. ἐλαίου παλαιοῦ κοτύλας δ'. ἐγὼ δὲ ἐλαίου κοτύλας γ'. 50 drachmae of litharge, 50 drachmae of bitumen, 50 drachmae of bees wax, 50 drachmae of Bruttium pitch, 15 drachmae of toasted pine resin, 12 drachmae of copper flakes, 14 drachmae of incense, 8 drachmae of galbanum, 14 drachmae of copper ore, 6 aloes drachmae, 4 [drachmae] oak gall, 4 drachmae of myrrh, 6 long-born aristolochia, 4 drachmae of round-born aristolochia, 4 kotylae of old oil; but I [add] 3 kotylae of oil.

Galen lists here the active ingredients and excipients necessary for the mixture of fifteen drugs in total, without an explanation of their therapeutic application. However, J. Scarborough considers that this plaster would have been used

with the combination [of the medicines] (ή δὲ τῆς ἀπλουστέρας βαρβάρου συμμετρία τῆ συνθέσει), and is prepared with 5 [drachmae] of pitch, bees wax, pine resin, toasted resin, bitumen, 1 litra of these, 10 of litharge, 5 of white lead, 5 of vedigris, 3 of opopanax; 9 unciae of winter oil, 6 unciae of summer (πίσσης, κηροῦ, ὑητίνης πιτυῗνης, ὑητίνης φρυκτῆς, ἀσφάλτου τῶν ε'. τούτων ἀνὰ λίτραν α'. λιθαργύρου ι'. ψιμυθίου ε'. ἰοῦ ε'. ὀποπάνακος γ'. ἐλαίου χειμῶνος οὐγγίας θ'. θἑρους οὐγγίας στ'). For this recipe, he indicates the following preparation: the soluble and dry are poured into a mortar to be crushed with acid vinegar (τὰ τηκτὰ κατὰ τῶν ξηρῶν καταχεῖται λελειωμένων ἐν θυεία μετ' ὄξους δριμἑος). And he adds 1 of henbane juice, medium (?), and one of opium (ἐὰν δὲ ἀνωδυνώτερον εἶναι βουληθῆς τὸ φάρμακον, προσμίξεις ὑοσκυάμου χυλοῦ α'. ἥμισυ. καὶ ὀπίου α').

⁷⁵ All translations from the original Greek to English are by Paola DRUILLE, who follows the editions specified in the notes.

⁷⁶ J. SCARBOROUGH, Iulianus (of Alexandria?) (ca 140–160 CE), [in:] The Encyclopedia of Ancient Natural Scientists. The Greek Tradition and its Many Heirs, ed. P.T. KEYSER, G.L. IRBY, London–New York 2008, p. 448, bases its deduction on the statement it is already more than twenty years since I met him in Alexandria, since when he has written handbook upon handbook, always changing them and altering them, never content with what he has written. He also maintains that Iulianus had studied with Apollonides of Ciprus, although due to Galen's nuanced condemnation, few remains of Iulianus's writings remain. Against Iulianus Galen so completely demolishes Methodism's medical logic that Tecusan simply edits and translates the entire tract to suggest the involuted and precise philosophical sarcasm applied to Methodist doctrine, also explicated by Hankinson (1991: 145–160) (J. SCARBOR-OUGH, Iulianus..., p. 448).

to close wounds and soothe pain⁷⁷, and adds that *the enaimos, prepared in bulk, probably was an ordinarily available plaster to treat wounds suffered by gladiators.* The litharge, the copper flakes and the calcite conferred astringent properties to the skin, the Dead Sea bitumen (asphalts) constituted an occlusive layer to protect it, and the adhesive properties given by beeswax, the carefully roasted pine resin and the pine pitch from Brutcia, would have ensured the practicality of the ἕναιμος. Finally, the smaller amounts of frankincense, myrrh, two types of aristolochia and aloe latex provided the plaster with a mild analgesic and antibiotic quality, augmented with oak gall⁷⁸. Galen does not provide further information on Ἄλλη ἕναιμος Ἰουλιανοῦ. On the contrary, he quickly introduces the prescriptions of the Bάρβαρος "Hρα (ed. Kühn, 13.557–560), whose formulations largely coincide with the plaster of Iulianus.

πρός τὰς ἀξιολόγους διαιρέσεις καὶ μάλιστα πρὸς τὰς ἐν τῆ κεφαλῆ, πρὸς σύριγγας, κόλπους⁸⁰, κατάγματα. [...] καὶ ἡπατικοῖς καὶ σπληνικοῖς, ἀφλεγμάντως [...]. ἐπὶ νεύοων καὶ χόνδρων διακεκομμένων καὶ ὀστῶν, ἐπέχει δὲ παραδόξως καὶ αἶμα φερόμενον [...] πρὸς ὑποφορὰς καὶ κόλπους, κολλῷ γὰρ μεγάλως καὶ ἐπὶ τῶν ἀποστημάτων κομισάμενος τὸ ὑγρὸν [...] ἔστι καὶ ἴσγαιμος καλλίστη μάλιστα ἐπὶ τῶν αἶμα ἀναγόντων. ἐμπλάσας δὲ εἰς δέρματα δύο, ἕν μὲν ἐπὶ τὰ στήθη καὶ τὰς πλευρὰς ἐπιτίθει, ἕτερον δὲ ἐπὶ τὸ μετάφρενον, παραδόξως ἐπέχει τὸ αἶμα. [...] καὶ πρὸς κυνόδηκτα καὶ ἀνθρωπόδηκτα, τὸ ὅλον άφλέγμαντος [...] λῦε χειμῶνος δι' ἡμερῶν έπτὰ, θέρους διὰ ε'. ἐὰν δὲ ἐπείγῃ διὰ τριῶν.

for major wounds and especially for those of the head, for fistulous abscesses, fistulous ulcers, fractures; [...] to those who suffer from liver and splenic disease, without inflation [...]; for nerves, broken cartilage and bones, place in the opposite direction to the outgoing blood [...]. Also as a drainage for fistulous ulcers, which coalesces to a great extent and carries fluids towards abscesses [...]; it is very good for getting stagnant blood moving. Plaster on two parts of the skin, one is applied on the chest and [area of] the ribs, another on the back, applied in the opposite direction to the outgoing blood [...]. For dog and human bites, all without inflammation [...]. It wash (the wounds) after seven days in winter, five days in summer. If there is pressure, [open] it after three days.

⁷⁷ J. Scarborough, *Iulianus...*, p. 448.

⁷⁸ J. SCARBOROUGH, *Iulianus*..., p. 448.

⁷⁹ In medicine, βάρβαρος, plural βαρβάρα, is the name of various plasters. For Galen, cf. *supra* notes 73 and 74.

⁸⁰ Cf. *LSJ*, s.v. κόλπος. It has the meaning of "belly", but also of "fistulous ulcer" that extends under the skin. Cf. DIOSCORIDES, 1, 128.

This plethora of applications for the treatment of conditions related to bleeding wounds is due to the beneficial drugs that make up the prescription which, in the same way as the "Apostles' Ointment", requires pharmaceutical knowledge of the conditions that may affect its efficacy. Galen refers to the exact administration of the plaster, paying particular attention to the condition of the treated wound (ἐἀν δὲ ἐπείγῃ διὰ τριῶν, *if there is pressure*, [open] *after three days*) and to the prevailing temperature in the winter and summer seasons (λῦε χειμῶνος δι' ἡμερῶν ἑπτὰ, θέρους διὰ ε', *open after seven days in winter, five days in summer*), and adds up to a total of nine ingredients (ed. Kühn, 13.558), whose precise fractionation and weight of the active ingredients and necessary excipients follow the quantities indicated in the formula specified below:

κηροῦ λίτραν μίαν, πίσσης λίτραν μίαν, ἀσφάλτου λίτραν, μίαν, πιτυΐνης λίτραν μίαν, μάννης οὐγγίας στ'. ψιμυθίου οὐγγίας δ'. χαλκάνθης οὐγγίας δ'. ἀποπάνακος οὐγγίας β'. ἐλαίου ἡμιούγγιον, οἱ μὲν ἡμίμναν, οἱ δὲ ἡμίλιτραν, ὅξους κοτύλας β'. 1 litra of bees wax, 1 litra of pitch, 1 litra of bitumen, 1 litra [resin?] of pine, 6 unciae of gum, 4 unciae of white lead, 4 unciae of copper sulphate, 2 unciae of opopanax, semi-uncia of oil olive, on the one hand semi-mineral, on the other semi-litra, 2 kotylae of vinegar.

He then lays out the process of making the prescription (13, 558–559), describing the pharmacotechnical operations of mixing, melting, grinding, sieving, cooling, as detailed below:

κηρὸν, ἄσφαλτον, ἕλαιον, ὄξος ὀλίγον [...], εἰς χύτραν καινὴν βαλὼν τῆκε, εἶτα ἐπίβαλλε τὴν πίσσαν καὶ τὴν ῥητίνην λεπτοκοπήσας ἐπιμελῶς. ὅταν ἡμίεφθος ἦ, ἄρας τὴν χύτραν καὶ διαψύξας ποσῶς ἕμπασσε διηθημένον τὸ χάλκανθον λειωθὲν ὄξει, ἐκ τῶν δύο κοτυλῶν κατὰ μικρὸν, ἵνα μὴ ὑπερζέσῃ [...] ὅταν ἀμόλυντος ἦ, ἄρας ἀπὸ τοῦ πυρὸς, ἔγχει τὸν ὀποπάνακα πρὸ μιᾶς βεβρεγμένον εἰς μέρος τοῦ ὑπολειπομένου ὄξους, ὥστε διαλυθῆναι, εἶτα ἕμπασον τὸ ψιμύθιον καὶ τὴν μάνναν ὁμοῦ ἐπιμελῶς λελειωμένα [...], ὡς ἑνωθῆναι φυλασσόμενος μὴ προσκαῆ ὀποπάναξ καὶ ἡ μάννα, κατάχει εἰς θυείαν καὶ ἐάσας ψυγῆναι, ἀναμαλάξας ἀπόθου καὶ χρῶ. throw bees wax, bitumen, olive oil, a little vinegar [...], melt it in a new pot. Then pitch and fine minced resin are carefully poured on top. When it is half boiled, when removing the pot and cooling it for a certain time, sprinkle the filtered solution of copper sulphate emulsifying with vinegar, with two kotylae little by little, so that it does not boil (completely) [...]. When it does not stain, remove from the heat, pour the opopanax for a maceration in a part of old vinegar, as it dissolves, then sprinkle together the carefully crushed white lead and gum [...], to unify the reserved opopanax that did not boil and the gum, is poured into the glass and allowed to cool, after collecting by rubbing, place and use.

Like the "Apostles' Ointment", the elaboration process of Galen's compound requires a series of operations, which determine the final product. By mixing the active ingredients and excipients, and heating these components, grinding and sieving the solid drugs, and unifying all the ingredients, which also intersperses a careful cooling step, after various moments of heating the ingredients, the physician is assured of obtaining a homogeneous compound with the adequate degree of moisture and softness.

On the other hand, the second prescription included within Βάρβαρος "Ηρα is designated "another *barbaros Hera*" (ἄλλη βάρβαρος "Ηρα, ed. Kühn, 13.559–560). Unlike the formulation of the μέλαινα ἔμπλαστρος ἔναιμος, Galen explains the name of this prescription using these terms:

ό μὲν "Ηρας ταύτης μόνης προὕγραψε τὸ βάρβαρος. ἐγὼ δὲ καὶ τὴν ἔμπροσθεν ὁμοίως ἀνόμασα, καίτοι μέλαιναν ὑπ' αὐτοῦ κεκλημένην, ἐπειδὴ τὰς δι' ἀσφάλτου βαρβάρους εἰώθασι καλεῖν οἱ πλεῖστοι τῶν νεωτέρων ἰατρῶν. αὐτὸς δὲ ὁ "Ηρας οὕτως περὶ αὐτῆς ἔγραψε κατὰ λέξιν (ed. Kühn 13.559–560). On the one hand, this single Hera was designated before the [name of the] ointment, and, on the other, I called it similarly before; however, she has been named *melaina* by him, and later most of the younger physician are used to calling her barbarians because of the asphalt. He himself wrote about Hera herself as the phrase says.

Galen does not indicate other data about $å\lambda\lambda\eta$ $\beta \delta \rho \beta \alpha \rho o \varsigma$ "H $\rho \alpha$, nor does he mention the names of the physicians who call this formulation $\mu \epsilon \lambda \alpha \nu \alpha \nu$ or $\beta \alpha \rho \beta \delta \rho \nu \varsigma$. On the contrary, once the prescription is named, Galen notes down the details of the application of the ointment according to this prescription:

πρὸς τὰ νεότρωτα, κόλπους, κυνόδηκτα, ἀνθρωπόδηκτα, κονδυλώματα φλεγμαίνοντα, πρὸς τὰ ἐν ἄρθροις πάντα [...] καὶ πρὸς ποδάγραν. for fresh sores (fresh wounds), fistulous ulcers, [wounds] caused by a dog bite, human bite, inflamed callus lump (with pus), for all [diseases] in the joints [...] and for gout [...]

Then, he documents the active ingredients and excipients of its composition, together with their fractions and weight (13, 560):

κηροῦ μνᾶν α'. πίσσης μνᾶν α'. ἡητίνης φρυκτῆς μνᾶν α'. ἀσφάλτου Ἰουδαϊκῆς μνᾶν α'. λιθαργύρου ι'. ψιμυθίου ε'. ἰοῦ ν'. ἀποπάνακος δ'. ἐλαίου κοτύλην α'. ὄξους κύαθον α'. 1 mine of wax, 1 mine of pitch, 1 mine of toasted pine resin, 1 mine of bitumen *ju-daicum*, 10 of litharge, 5 of white lead, 50 of verdigris, 4 of opopanax, 1 kotyle of oil [olive], 1 cup of vinegar.

Finally, he recommends that each of these drugs be carefully mixed, starting from the strict implementation of the steps the physician adds towards the end of his prescription:

ἕψε κηρὸν πίσσαν, ἄσφαλτον, ἡητίνην ἕως τακῆ, εἶτα τὰ λοιπὰ μετὰ τοῦ ἐλαίου λελειοτριβημένα ἔμβαλλε, καὶ βαστάσας καὶ μικρὸν διαψύξας ἐκ τοῦ ὅξους κατ' ὀλίγον ἐπίσταζε. boil the wax, the resin, the bitumen, the pine resin until it melts, then add the rest, mixing with oil, instill little by little, taking and aerating a small [quantity].

It may be noted that Galen devotes a brief space to the preparation of the prescription, the more extensive explanation of which might conform to that added in $\mu \epsilon \lambda \alpha \tau \rho \alpha c$. Furthermore, its formulation follows very closely both the one indicated in the two previous prescriptions and the one repeated by the Syriac mixture, as shown in the comparative table:

Άλλη ἔναιμος Ίουλιανοῦ	μέλαινα ἔμπλαστρος	ἄλλη βάρβαρος "Ηρα	Apostles' Ointment
Bees wax	wax	wax	wax
Pitch of Bruttium	pitch	pitch	
bitumen	bitumen	<i>judaicum</i> bitumen	
toasted pine resin	pine [resin?]	toasted pine resin	resin
copper flakes and calcitis	copper sulphate	verdigris	verdigris
frankincense			frankincense
myrrh			myrrh
galbanum			galbanum
			bdellium
aloes			aloes
oak gall			
long-birthwort			birthwort (long)
round birthwort			
litharge		litharge	litharge
oil	oil olive	oil [olive]	olive oil
old oil			(in the summer)
			olive oil
			(in the winter)

Ἄλλη ἕναιμος Ίουλιανοῦ	μέλαινα ἔμπλαστρος	ἄλλη βάρβαρος "Ηρα	Apostles' Ointment
	gum white lead	white lead	gum ammoniac
	opopanax vinegar	opopanax vinegar	opopanax vinegar

The prescriptions account for 14 (Άλλλη ἕναιμος Ἰουλιανοῦ) and 10 drugs (μέλαινα ἕμπλαστρος, ἄλλλη βάρβαρος "Ηρα) respectively, whose main therapeutic action, as in the case of the Syriac plaster, is against sores, ulcers and fistulas, differing in their etiology "by dog bite or human bite" (κυνόδηκτα, ἀνθρωπό-δηκτα). Of the fourteen drugs described in the Apostles' Ointment, ten match Ἄλλη ἕναιμος Ἰουλιανοῦ, and seven match μέλαινα ἕμπλαστρος and ἄλλη βάρβαρος "Ηρα.

Although we cannot affirm that the Syriac author used one of Galen's prescriptions for his ointment, or a combination of the three prescriptions based on the best therapeutic efficacy of the drugs that compose them, according to his experience, we can observe that both the therapeutic indications and the qualitative formulation of Galen's prescriptions are related to the Syriac prescription, beyond the differences in the proper name of the prescription and in the amount of drugs in its formulation. This relationship becomes even more feasible when we observe that other late-antique physicians, who wrote in Greek and may have kept the formulation in force throughout the centuries, replicated the formulations transmitted by Galen with some modifications.

The Βάρβαρος ἔναιμος by Oribasius, Ἡρᾶ Καππάδοκος βάρβαρος by Aetius and Βαρβάρα ἔναιμος by Paul

In the medical treatises by Oribasius, Aetius of Amidas and Paul of Aegina, mention is made of the plaster for bleeding wounds, with indications similar to those mentioned in Galen's prescriptions. In *Eclogae medicamentorum* 87 (ed. Raeder, 6.2.2.263-266), Oribasius incorporates a section called ["]Εμπλαστροι ἔναιμοι πρὸς νευροτρώτους- ai δ' aὐτaì ποιοῦσι κaì πρὸς τὰς περιθλάσεις τῶν νεύρων ("Plasters for bleeding wounds from tendon/muscle injuries, which are also made for nerve contusions" 87 tl. (ed. Raeder, 6.2.2.263). This section contains a total of sixteen plaster formulations⁸¹, where Oribasius prescribes a particular plaster,

⁸¹ ORIBASIUS includes a total of sixteen plasters. These are as follows: "[Plaster] kíssinon for tendon wounds and injuries" (Τὸ κίσσινον πρὸς νευροτρώτους καὶ νύγματα, 87, 1), "[Plaster] Indē"

which he calls Báp β apoç \check{e} vaı μ oç 87, 7 (ed. Raeder, 6.2.2.264) and which he recommends for the following cases:

πρὸς τὰς ἀξιολόγους διαιρέσεις, μάλιστα ἐν κεφαλῆ, ὀστέα διακεκομμένα, χόνδρους, ἡπατικούς, σπληνικούς, αἶμα ἀνάγοντας, πρός τε κυνόδηκτα, ἀνθρωπόδηκτα, κόλπους for considerable injury, especially in the head, bone fissures, cartilage, liver diseases, splenic, outgoing blood; also for (wounds) caused by a dog bite, human bite, fistulous ulcers.

After the therapeutic applications, he documents the types of single drugs and their quantities:

Κηροῦ, πίσσης ξηρᾶς, ἀσφάλτου, πιτυΐνης ἀνὰ <α>, μάννης <ς>, ψιμυθίου, χαλκάνθου ἀνὰ <δ>, ὀποπάνακος <β>, ἐλαίου <ε>, ὄξους <β>. 1 [drachma] of wax, solid pitch, bitumen, pine resin, 6 [drachmae] of powder of frankincese, white lead, 4 [drachmae] of copper sulfate, 2 [drachmae] of opopanax, 5 [kotylae] of oil [olive], 2 [kotylae] of vinegar.

While he devotes the final part of his prescription to writing the instructions for the preparation of the plaster:

τὰ τηκτὰ τήξας ἐπάρας τε ἀπὸ τοῦ πυρὸς ἕνσταζε τὸν χάλκανθον διειμένον ὄξει καὶ ἐπιστήσας ἕψε, εἶτ' ἐπάρας πάλιν ἐπίβαλε τὸ ψιμύθιον λελειωμένον ὄξει καὶ πάλιν ἕψε, ἐπὶ τέλει δὲ μάνναν καὶ ὀποπάνακα, καὶ εὐθέως περισπάθιζε, ἕως ψυγῆ, καὶ χρῶ Instill the dissolved copper sulfate in vinegar after melting and stirring the soluble ones in the fire and boiling; after stirring again, add the white lead, emulsified with vinegar and boil again and, finally, [add] the powder of frankincense and opopanax hispidus; cool (until) dawn, and use.

⁽H Ἰνδή, 87, 2), "[Plaster] gray or orange of Galen" (Η φαιὰ Γαληνοῦ ἤτοι κιρρά, 87, 3), "[Plaster] sallow for injuries (on tendons), injuries on tendons and all (other) bleeding wounds" (Τὸ μελάγχλωρον νύγμασι, νευροτρώτοις καὶ πᾶσι τοῖς ἐναίμοις, 87, 4), "[Plaster] with a mixture of vinegar and oil" (Η δι' ὀξελαίου, 87, 5), "[Plaster] Catagmatic saitis, bleeding wound, headache, fistulous ulcer fluency" (Η Σαΐτις καταγματική, ἔναιμος, κεφαλική, κόλπων κολλητική, 87, 6), "[Plaster] Athēna" (Η Ἀθηνᾶ, 87, 8), "[Plaster] with willow/Salix" (Η δι' ἰτεῶν, 87, 9), "[Plaster] also applied in bruised in the sinews as Galen's systematic preparation of tendon wounds" (Νευροτρώτων ἐμμέθοδος θεραπεία ἐκ τῶν Γαληνοῦ ἡ καὶ τοῖς νευροθλάστοις ἀρμόζουσα, 87, 10), "[Plaster] for special apostasis in tendon wounds" (Πρὸς μερικὰς ἀποστάσεις ἐπὶ νευροτρώτων, 87, 11), "Enaimos plaster for boxers" (Εναιμος κολλητικὴ πυκτική, 87, 12), "Preparation [of the plaster] Apochymatos" (Μαλακτικὴ ἐπισπαστική, 87, 13), "[Plaster] xystikon" (Ξυστικόν, 87, 14), "Emollient plaster" (Μαλακτικὴ ἐπισπαστική, 87, 15), "Plaster aichmalōtos" (Η αἰμμάλωτος, 87, 16).

Oribasius then mentions a prescription similar to those by Galen, called "plaster for bleeding wounds" (Βάρβαρος ἔναιμος). However, Oribasius does not incorporate litharge and replaces verdigris with copper sulfate, present in Galen's μέλαινα ἕμπλαστρος. The remaining drugs from Oribasius' Βάρβαρος ἕναιμος remain unchanged in relation to Galen's formulation, totaling ten drugs.

In *Iatricorum liber* XV, 14, 20–46 (ed. Zervos, p. 7–138) by Aetius, on the other hand, mention is made of a prescription called "*Barbaros* Cappadocian *Hera*", which they simply call "plaster" (Ηρᾶ Καππάδοκος βάρβαρος, ἥντινες ἄφραν καλοῦσιν), and it is stated that it is a "melaine plasters" (Μέλαινα ἔμπλαστρος). Aetius recommends using this prescription:

πρὸς τὰς ἀξιολόγους διαθέσεις καὶ μάλιστα πρὸς τὰς ἐν τῆ κεφαλῆ, πρὸς σύριγγας, κόλπους, κατάγματα ἀφλεγμάντως κολλῶσα, [...] ἐπὶ νεύρων καὶ χόνδρων διακεκομμένων καὶ ὀστῶν· ποιεῖ πρὸς ὑποφοράς, κόλπους κολλῷ μεγάλους καὶ ἐπὶ τῶν ἀποστημάτων διελὼν καὶ κομισάμενος τὸ ὑγρόν [...] καὶ ἡπατικοῖς καὶ σπληνικοῖς· [...] δὲ καὶ ἔναιμος καλλίστη καὶ ἐπὶ τῶν αἶμα ἀναγόντων. Ἐμπλάσας εἰς δέρματα δύο, ἕν μὲν ἐπὶ τὸ στῆθος καὶ τὰς πλευρὰς ἐπιτίθει, ἕτερον δ' ἐπὶ τὸ μετάφρενον, παραδόξως γὰρ ἐπέχει τὸ αἰμα· ποιεῖ καὶ πρὸς κυνοδήκτους καὶ ἀνθρωποδήκτους· ἔστι γὰρ καθόλου ἀφλέγμαντος [...] for important conditions and especially for those in the head, for fistulous abscess, fistulous ulcer, fracture united free from inflammation, [...] for tendons, broken cartilage and bones, for drainage, large fractures that joins quickly united, divided abscesses, and fluid removed [...] [affections] liver and splenic [...] especially [for wounds] with blood and outgoing blood. It is plastered on two parts of the skin, one is applied on the chest and [area of] the ribs, another on the back, it is applied in the opposite direction to the outgoing blood [...] also for bites caused by a dog and by a human and, in general, it is anti-inflammatory [...]

He immediately lists the drugs in the compound, without further information regarding quantities, except for some particular drugs:

Κηροῦ, πίσσης, ἀσφάλτου, πιτυῖνης, ἀνὰ λίτραν α, μάννης οὐγγίας ἕξ, ψιμμυθίου, χαλκάνθου ἀνὰ οὐγγίας τέσσαρας, ὀποπάνακος οὐγγίας δύο, ἐλαίου, ὄξους, ἀνὰ λίτ. α· 1 litra of wax, pitch, bitumen, pine resin, 6 unciae of powder of frankincense, white lead, 4 unciae of copper sulfate, 2 unciae of opopanax, oil (olive), vinegar, 1 litra.

At the same time, he indicates a long and careful elaboration process, which combines the different substances previously dosed:

τὸν κηρὸν καὶ τὴν ἄσφαλτον λεπτομερῶς κεκομμένην, τὸ ἔλαιον καὶ τὸ ὄξος εἰς χύτραν βαλών καινήν, όλίγον τοῦ ὄξους καταλιπών τῆκε κινῶν· τακέντων δ' ἐπίβαλλε πίσσαν, πιτυΐνην, λεπτοκοπήσας· τακεισῶν δὲ καὶ αὐτῶν, διήθει καὶ πάλιν ἕψε· ὅταν δὲ ἡμίεφθος γένηται, ἄρας την χύτραν ἀπὸ τοῦ πυρός, ἐπίβαλλε χάλκανθον λειωθέν σὺν ὄξει όλίγω κατὰ μικρόν δέ, ἵνα μὴ ἀναζέσῃ, καὶ έψε πάλιν μαλακωτάτω πυρί· ὅταν δὲ ἀμόλυντον γένηται, ἄρας τὴν χύτραν ἀπὸ τοῦ πυρός, ἐπίβαλλε τὸν ὀποπάνακα προλειωθέντα τῷ ὑπολοίπῳ ὄξει· εἶτα ἔμπασσε ψιμμύθιον καὶ μάνναν λειότατα γενόμενα ξηρά· καὶ μικρὸν χλιάνας, ὡς ἑνωθῆναι μόνον, φυλασσόμενος μή προσκαῆ ὁ ὀποπάναξ καὶ ἡ μάννα, κατάχεε έν θυία, καὶ ἐάσας ψυγῆναι, ἀναμαλάξας, ἀπόθου καὶ χρῶ, ὡς προείρηται. [...] τὰς τραυματικὰς πάσας ἐνίκησεν, ὡς ἡ πεῖρα δέδειχε· καὶ λῦε χειμῶνος μὲν δι' ἡμερῶν ἑπτά, θέρους δὲ διὰ τριῶν.

Placing the oil and vinegar in a new pot dissolves the finely cut wax and bitumen, a bit of reserved vinegar, to stir; the melted pitch is placed, finely chopped; after dissolving them, filter and boil again; When it is half-boiling, put the pot on the fire, gradually place emulsified copper sulfate with a little vinegar, so that it does not boil (to a boil), and boil again over a very low heat; taking care that it does not stick, putting the pot on the fire, place crushed opopanax with the remaining vinegar; then sprinkle with dry white lead and powder of frankincense; once warm, as unified, the opopanax and the stored powder of frankincense that does not burn, pour into a mortar, and let it dry, softening completely, store and use, as prescribed [...] all wounds prevail, as experience show. It opens after seven days in winter, three days in summer.

From the name of plaster appearing in *Iatricorum liber* XV, 14, we can deduce that it would probably be the most popular plaster of the 6th century CE, due to the large number of therapeutic applications that its use covers. In comparison with the prescriptions by Galen and Oribasius, the qualitative formulation of the "*Barbaros* Cappadocian *Hera*" (Hpã Kaππάδοκος βάρβαρος) is identical to that of Oribasius.

Finally, in *Epitomae medicae libri septem*, 7, 17 (ed. Heiberg, 7.358) by Paul, there is a section about medical formulations "On plasters, and things to be added to the boiling, from the works of Antilus, and on the proportion of wax to oil" (Περὶ ἐμπλάστρων καὶ ἐμβαλλομένων εἰς τὰς ἑψήσεις αὐτῶν, ἐκ τῶν Ἀντύλλου- καὶ περὶ συμμετρίας κηροῦ πρὸς ἔλαιον, 7, 17, t1), intended for the treatment of various conditions. According to Paul, some of these plasters *are for wounds and are called plasters for bleeding* [wounds], *binders and fracture plasters, which must be composed of desiccants* (αὐτῶν δὲ τῶν ἐμπλάστρων αἱ μέν εἰσι τραυματικαί, ἃς ἐναίμους τε καὶ κολλητικὰς καὶ καταγματικὰς καλοῦμεν, διὰ τῶν ξηραινόν). These desiccants are willow, oak, cypress, pine bark and pitch, myrrh, rosemary, bitumen, aloe, motherwort, vine wood ashes, ceruse, litharge and most metals⁸².

⁸² *Epitomae medicae libri septem*, 7, 17, Paul advises boiling such desiccants until they do not stain. He claims that healing plasters are also made up of desiccants, but more than binders. Such are burnt copper, aeris and ferri scale, verdigris, calcitis, burnt copper flower, alum, gall, molybdenum, calamine, pumice, and shells. Regarding the discutients, he affirms that they are formed from heating

He also maintains that it is necessary to apply the plasters for bleeding [wounds] when the injuries or fractures are recent, and *to open after three days* (λύειν τε διὰ τρίτης, 7, 17, 1). Among the plasters with these characteristics, Paul includes the "plaster for bleeding wounds, which is prescribed for fractured bones" (Βαρβάρα ἕναιμος- καὶ πώρους καταγμμάτων δείκνυσιν, 7, 17, 42), naming the plaster as Oribasius does, although he does not elaborate on its etiology. He only specifies its most important application, "for fractured bones" (πώρους καταγμάτων δείκνυσιν), the drugs in the prescription and their quantities:

Άσφάλτου Ίουδαϊκοῦ, πίσσης ξηρᾶς, κηροῦ, ῥητίνης ἀνὰ λι. <a>, τερεβινθίνης <β>, λιθαργύρου <a>, ψιμυθίου <a>', μάννης <β>, ὀποπάνακος <β>, σμύρνης <β>, ἐλαίου <γ>, ὄξους τὸ ἀρκοῦν. 1 litra of judaicum bitumen, solid pitch, wax, pine resin, 2 of terebinth, 1 of litharge, 1 of white lead, 2 of powder of frankincese, 2 of opopanax, 2 of myrrh, 3 of oil (olive), whatever is strictly necessary to vinegar.

In addition, Paul does not provide further instructions for preparing the prescription, apart from the recommendation that a sparing amount of vinegar should be used during the process. With respect to the formulation, he is the only Greek physician analyzed in our study who counts twelve medicines in total. Of these, Paul resumes the use of litharge from Galen's formulation and, as the other Greek authors do, uses white lead and hydrocarbons (picth and bitumen), discarded by the Syriac prescription. Finally, we observed that Paul incorporates drugs, such as myrrh (which also appears in the Galenic and Syriac plasters) and terebinth, but does not add verdigris or copper sulfate. Summarizing, of the fourteen drugs described in the Apostles' Ointment, seven match the last Greek recipes described.

Conclusion

The "Apostles' Ointment" from *The Book of Medicines* is the Syriac version of a compound medicine of Greek origin, possibly Christianized by Syriac physicians. While it is difficult to determine the Greek antecedents of the Syriac

and moderately desiccants, such as motherwort, thapsia, old oil and oil of radishes, honey, opobalm, fish, turpentine, galbanum, burnt salts and fleur de sel. In relation to emollients, he maintains that they are formed from litharge, fats, marrow, old oil, bee glue, ammonia, storax, galbanum, bdellium, chew, turpentine, marshmallow root and wild cucumber. Desiccants are made of sulfur, natron, salts, ash, bitumen. It also describes the epispastics, formed from salts, natron, bee glue, verdigris, yeast, manure, sulfur, turpentine, and digestives, composed of wax, labdanum, raisins, amonum, safiron, incense, tar, Egyptian putty, storach, myrrh, galbanum, butter, oesypum, fat, verdigris. Finally, mention the suppuratives, formed from water and oil, pollen, wheat bread, chondro, butter, pork and beef fat, frank incense, tar, rosin, the paregoric, made of litharge, ceruse, oil, dill, chamomile, starch, white wax.

prescription, and even more so the origin of the name given by the Syriac physicians to the Greek ointment, our analysis of the prescriptions by Galen, Oribasius, Aetius and Paul gave us evidences that any of them or all could constitute the sources of the Apostles' Ointment, and then the author of this Syriac recipe felt free to modify it when mix different drugs from different sources. Another clue about the origin of this recipe could be in the content of the Syriac translation of *De com*positione medicamentorum per genera, which unfortunately is not preserved⁸³. The Greek authors that we have studied called Βάρβαρος "Ηρα (Galen, ed. Kühn, 13.557-560) or Ἄλλη ἔναιμος Ἰουλιανοῦ (Galen, ed. Kühn, 13.557), Βάρβαρος ἔναιμος (Oribasius, ed. Raeder, 6.2.2.264), Ἡρᾶ Καππάδοκος βάρβαρος (Aetius, ed. Zervos, p. 7–138), and Bap β ápa čvau μ o ζ (Paul, ed. Heiberg, 7.358), with the subsequent perception of a noticeable change in the denomination of the prescription in *The Book of Medicines*. The Syriacs give the name "[plaster \leftarrow] which is called the Twelve, after the Twelve Apostles" to the prescription of Greek origin, incorporating the plaster into the Syriac-Christian pharmaceutical literature, sometime during the Abbasid Islamic period, as we have been able to ascertain through our philological dating. We also suggest that the name would have been popularized earlier, probably after Paul, since he was the first to formulate this medicine with twelve drugs instead of ten; but unfortunately there is no evidences for this. The Syriac prescription mentions fourteen drugs and incorporates some innovation, by both discarding white lead and hydrocarbons (pitch and bitumen) and adding bdellium. Although it is difficult to justify the name of the Apostles' Ointment from the number of ingredients, we can observe that, after Paul, the prescription would appear Christianized in the Syriac pharmaceutical literature, making the Syriac physicians who may Christianized the name of the Greek prescription, surviving with this name during the Arabic⁸⁴ and Latin⁸⁵ period.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Aetíou Amidīnoú lógos dékatos pémptos, ed. S. ZERVOS, "Aθήνα" 21, 1909, p. 7–138. Antidotarium Romanum, seu Modus componendi medicamenta quae sunt in usu, Venetiis 1585. AVICENNA, al-Qānūn fī al-tibb, Bulaq, al-Matba'ah al-'Āmirah 1878.

⁸³ Cf. G. KESSEL, Inventory of Galen's Extant Works in Syriac, [in:] Hunayn Ibn Ishaq on his Galen Translations, Provo 2016, p. 168–192.

⁸⁴ D. ASADE, Recepción del Ungüento de los apóstoles en el Formulario de los hospitales de Ibn Abī *l-Bayān*, [in:] Religión, Derecho y Medicina en Egipto Antiguo, Tardoantiguo y Medieval. Actas del Ciclo de Conferencias en la Embajada de la República Árabe de Egipto, ed. P. DRUILLE, D. ASADE, Santa Rosa 2021 (in press).

⁸⁵ Cf. Antidotarium Romanum, seu Modus componendi medicamenta quae sunt in usu, Venetiis 1585, p. 93.

- Le candélabre des Sanctuaires de Grégoire Aboulfaradj dit Barhebraeus, ed. et trans. J. Вакоš, Paris 1933 [= Patrologia orientalis, 24].
- El códice de Cyrurgia de Teodorico de la Biblioteca Universitaria de Granada. Teoría y praxis farmacéutica, trans. J.L. VALVERDE, M.T. BAUTISTA, Granada 1984.
- Le formulaire des hôpitaux d'Ibn Abil Bayan, médecin du Bimaristan Annacery au Caire = al-Dustūr al-bīmāristānī, ed. P. Sbath, Le Caire 1933.
- GALEN, De compositione medicamentorum per genera libri VII, [in:] Claudii Galeni opera omnia, vol. XIII, ed. C.G. KÜHN, Hildesheim 1965 (= Leipzig 1827).
- IBN ABI L-BAYAN, *El formulario de los hospitales de Ibn Abi L-Bayan*, ed. et trans. J.L. VALVERDE, M.C. PEÑA, Granada 1981.
- A List of Plants and their Properties from the Menârath kudhsê of Gregorius Bar 'Ebhrâya, ed. R.J.H. GOTTHEIL, [s.l.] 1886.
- MS BL Add 14661.
- Oribasii Collectionum medicarum reliquiae, libri XLIX–L, libri incerti, eclogae medicamentorum, ed. J. RAEDER, Leipzig–Berlin 1933 [= Corpus Medicorum Graecorum, 6.2.22].
- PAULUS AEGINETA, *Libri V–VII*, ed. J.L. HEIBERG, Leipzig–Berlin 1924 [= Corpus Medicorum Graecorum, 11.2].
- *Pedanii Dioscuridis Anazarbei de materia medica libri quinque*, vol. I–III, ed. M. WELLMANN, Berlin 1907–1914.
- SĀBŪR IBN SAHL, Dispensatorium Parvum (al-Aqrābādhīn al-saghīr), ed. O. KAHL, Leiden 1994 [= Islamic Philosophy, Theology and Science. Texts and Studies, 16], https://doi.org/ 10.1163/9789004450479
- Sābūr Ibn Sahl's Dispensatory in the Recension of the 'Adudī Hospital, ed. et trans. O. KAHL, Leiden 2009 [= Islamic Philosophy, Theology and Science. Texts and Studies, 78].
- Syrian Anatomy, Pathology and Therapeutics, or, The Book of Medicines, vol. I–II, ed. et trans. E.A.W. BUDGE, Oxford 1913.

Secondary Literature

- ASADE D., La literatura farmacéutica siríaca y árabe: comparación de las recetas de El Libro de las Medicinas (siríaco) con recetas en la literatura farmacéutica árabe, Buenos Aires 2017 (PhD dissertation).
- ASADE D., Recepción del Ungüento de los apóstoles en el Formulario de los hospitales de Ibn Abī *l-Bayān*, [in:] Religión, Derecho y Medicina en Egipto Antiguo, Tardoantiguo y Medieval. Actas del Ciclo de Conferencias en la Embajada de la República Árabe de Egipto, ed. P. DRUILLE, D. ASADE, Santa Rosa 2021 (in press).
- ASADE D., Las recetas de El Libro de las Medicinas (siríaco) y las que figuran en la literatura farmacéutica árabe: una comparación, "Dominguezia" 34.2, 2018, p. 5–13.
- ASADE D., GREIF E., Literatura farmacéutica en el mundo oriental medieval: la recuperación árabe del Libro de las Medicinas en lengua siríaca, "Scripta Mediaevalia" 12.1, 2019, p. 53–90.
- BAR BAHLUL H., DUVAL R., Lexicon Syriacum, Paris 1901.
- BECKER A.H., Fear of God and the Beginning of Wisdom. The School of Nisibis and the Development of Scholastic Culture in Late Antique Mesopotamia, Philadelphia 2006 [= Divinations: Rereading Late Ancient Religion], https://doi.org/10.9783/9780812201208

- BHAYRO S., Galen in Syriac: Rethinking Old Assumptions, "Aramaic Studies" 15, 2017, p. 132–154, https://doi.org/10.1163/17455227-01502003
- BHAYRO S., The Reception of Galen's Art of Medicine in the Syriac Book of Medicines, [in:] Medical Books in the Byzantine World, ed. B. ZIPSER, Bologna 2013.
- BHAYRO S., Syriac Medical Terminology: Sergius and Galen's Pharmacopia, "Aramaic Studies" 3.2, 2005, p. 147–165, https://doi.org/10.1177/1477835105059089
- BHAYRO S., Theory and Practice in the Syriac Book of Medicines, [in:] In the Wake of the Compendia. Infrastructural Contexts and the Licensing of Empiricism in Ancient and Medieval Mesopotamia, ed. J. CALE JOHNSON, Boston–Berlin 2015 [= Science, Technology and Medicine in Ancient Cultures, 3], p. 147–158, https://doi.org/10.1515/9781501502507-007
- BHAYRO S., BROCK S., The Syriac Galen Palimpsest and the Role of Syriac in the Transmission of Greek Medicine in the Orient, "Bulletin of the John Rylands Library" 89.1, 2013, p. 25–43, https://doi. org/10.7227/BJRL.89.S.3
- BHAYRO S., HAWLEY R., La littérature botanique et pharmaceutique en langue syriaque, [in:] Les sciences en syriaque, ed. E. VILLEY, Paris 2014 [= Études syriaques, 11], p. 285–318.
- BHAYRO S., RUDOLF S.M., Budge's Syriac Book of Medicines after One Hundred Years: Problems and Prospects, [in:] Mesopotamian Medicine and Magic. Studies in Honor of Markham J. Geller, ed. S.V. PANAYOTOV, L. VACÍN, Leiden 2018 [= Ancient Magic and Divination, 14], p. 116–130, https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004368088_008
- BHAYRO S., HAWLEY R., KESSEL G., PORMANN P.E., The Syriac Galen Palimpsest: Progress, Prospects and Problems, "Journal of Semitic Studies" 58.1, 2013, p. 131–148, https://doi.org/10.1093/jss/fgs042
- BROCK S., Sergios of Resh'aina, [in:] Gorgias Encyclopedic Dictionary of the Syriac Heritage, ed. S.P. BROCK, A.M. BUTTS, G.A. KIRAZ, L. VAN ROMPAY, Piscataway 2011, https://doi.org/ 10.31826/9781463213312
- BROWNE E.G., Arabian Medicine. Being the Fitz Patrick Lectures Delivered at the College of Physicians in November 1919 and November 1920, Cambridge 1921, https://doi.org/10.24157/ARC_11088
- CALÁ I., HAWLEY R., Transliteration versus Translation of Greek Plant Names in the Syriac Medical Writings of Sergius of Reš 'Aynā: On the Tables of Contents in BL Add. 14,661, "Aramaic Studies" 15.2, 2017, p. 155–182, https://doi.org/10.1163/17455227-01502004
- DEGEN R., Ein Corpus Medicorum Syriacorum, "Medizinhistorisches Journal" 7.1-2, 1972, p. 114-122.
- Dozy R.P.A., Supplément aux dictionnaires arabes, vol. I, Leiden 1927.
- DUKE J.A., Handbook of Medicinal Herbs, ²Boca Raton 2002, https://doi.org/10.1201/9781420040463
- EVANS W.C., TREASE G.E., EVANS D., Trease and Evans' Pharmacognosy, Edinburgh 2002.
- GIGNOUX P., Lexique des termes de la pharmacopée Syriaque, Paris 2011.
- GIGNOUX P., On the Syriac Pharmacopoeia, [in:] The Harp, vol. XI-XII, ed. G. PANICKER, J. THEKE-PARAMPIL, A. KALAKUDI, Boston-Berlin 2012, p. 193–202, https://doi.org/10.31826/97814 63233006-018
- GIGNOUX P., Le traité syriaque anonyme sur les medications, [in:] Symposium Syriacum VII: Uppsala University, Department of Asian and African Languages, 11–14 August 1996, ed. R. LAVENANT, Rome 1998 [= Orientalia Christiana Analecta, 256].
- GOTTHEIL R.J.H., *Berichtungen und Zusätze zu "A List of Plants*", "Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft" 43, 1889, p. 121–127.

- GUTAS D., Greek Thought, Arabic Culture. The Graeco-Arabic Translation Movement in Baghdad and Early 'Abbāsid Society (2nd-4th/8th-10th Centuries), London 1998.
- HAYES E.R., L'École d'Édesse, Paris 2012 (1930).
- KEIL G., Zur Datierung des 'Antidotarium Nicolai', "Sudhoffs Archiv" 62, 1978, p. 190-196.
- KESSEL G., Inventory of Galen's Extant Works in Syriac, [in:] Hunayn Ibn Ishaq on his Galen Translations, Provo 2016, p. 168–192.
- KEYSER P., IRBY G., *The Encyclopedia of Ancient Natural Scientists. The Greek Tradition and its Many Heirs*, London 2012.
- LE Coz C.R., Les chrétiens dans la médecine arabe, Paris 2006.
- Le Coz C.R., Les médecins nestoriens au Moyen-Âge. Les maîtres des Arabes (Comprendre le Moyen-Orient), Paris 2004.
- LEIKIN J.B., PALOUCEK F.P., Poisoning and Toxicology Handbook, Boca Raton 2008, https://doi. org/10.3109/9781420044805
- MARGOLIOUTH J.P.S., PAYNE S.R., A Compendious Syriac Dictionary. Founded upon the Thesaurus Syriacus, Oxford 1903.
- MERX A., Proben der syrischen Uebersetzung von Galenus' Schrift über die einfachen Heilmittel, "Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft" 39.2, 1885, p. 237–305.
- MEYERHOF M., Die Augenheilkunde in der von Budge herausgegebenen syrischen ärztlichen Handschrift, "Der Islam" 6, 1916, p. 257–268, https://doi.org/10.1515/islm.1915.6.3.257
- NUTTON V., Ancient Medicine, London 2004, https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203490914
- PORMANN P.E., SAVAGE-SMITH E., Medieval Islamic Medicine, Washington D.C. 2007.
- PUCCINOTTI F., Storia della medicina, vol. II, Medicina del Medio Evo, pars 2, Livorno 1859.
- REININK G.J., Theology and Medicine in Jundishapur: Cultural Change in the Nestorian School Tradition, [in:] Learned Antiquity. Scholarship and Society in the Near-East, the Greco-Roman World, and the Early Medieval West, ed. G.J. REININK, A.A. MACDONALD, M.W. TWOMEY, Leuven-Paris–Sterling 2003, p. 163–174.
- RODRÍGUEZ ADRADOS F. et al., Diccionario Griego-Español, Madrid 2020, http://dge.cchs.csic.es/xdge/
- RUDOLF S., Syrische Astrologie und das syrische Medizinbuch, Berlin 2018 [= Science, Technology, and Medicine in Ancient Cultures, 7], https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110565737
- SAMIR K., Ahrun Ibn A'yan Al-Qass, vol. I, New York 1991.
- SCARBOROUGH J., Iulianus (of Alexandria?) (ca 140–160 CE), [in:] The Encyclopedia of Ancient Natural Scientists. The Greek Tradition and its Many Heirs, ed. P.T. KEYSER, G.L. IRBY, London–New York 2008, p. 448–449.
- SÉLIS C., Les Syriens Orthodoxes et Catholiques, Belgique 1988.
- SOKOLOFF M., BROCKELMANN C., A Syriac Lexicon. A Translation from the Latin. Correction, Expansion, and Update of C. Brockelmann's Lexicon Syriacum, Winona Lake 2009.
- TECUSAN M., *The Fragments of the Methodists*, vol. I, *Text and Translation*, Leiden 2004 [= Studies in Ancient Medicine, 24.1], https://doi.org/10.1163/9789047412687
- TEMKIN O., Galenism. Rise and Decline of Medical Philosophy, Ithaca 1973.
- TEULE H.G.B., Les Assyro-Chaldéens. Chrétiens d'Irak, d'Iran et de Turquie, Turnhout 2008.

TEULE H.G.B., FOTESCU TAUWINKL C., TER HAAR ROMENY R.B., VAN GINKEL J.J., The Syriac Renaissance, Leuven-Walpole 2010 [= Eastern Christian Studies, 9].

UBIERNA P., Las humanidades. Notas para una historia institucional, Buenos Aires 2016.

Daniel Asade

University of Buenos Aires Faculty of Pharmacy and Biochemistry Pharmacobotany Museum "Juan A. Domínguez" Av. Belgrano 1675 1093 Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires, Argentina danielasade@hotmail.com

Paola Druille

National University of La Pampa Faculty of Human Sciences National Council for Scientific and Technical Research Interdisciplinary Institute for American and European Studies Mosconi 825 6300 Santa Rosa, La Pampa, Argentina paodruille@gmail.com



 ${f C}$ by the author, licensee University of Lodz – Lodz University Press, Lodz, Poland. This article is an COMMONS open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license CC BY-NC-ND 4.0 (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/)