

MAREK MEJOR

## Quotations from Vasubandhu in the HOR CHOS 'BYUNG

For Professor Klaus Sagaster

§1. In his brief systematic description of the Tibetan historical literature, A. Vostrikov devoted one chapter to the special class of this literature which is called "history of Religion or Doctrine" (*chos 'byung*).<sup>1</sup>

To this very important category of texts belong such famous books like B u s t o n ' s "History of Buddhism in India and Tibet" (*Chos 'byung*) from 1322 A.D., T ā r a n ā t h a ' s "History of Buddhism in India" (*Rgya gar gyi chos 'byung*) from 1608 A.D., and "History of Buddhism in Mongolia" (*Hor chos 'byung*) from 1819 A.D.

§2. The last named, the *Hor chos 'byung*, is a well-known work<sup>2</sup> compiled by a Mongolian scholar 'Jigs med rig pa'i rdo rje (Gu shrī Dka' bcu Su dhī Āyu warta alias Dbyangs can sgeg pa'i blo gros 'Jigs med rig pa'i rdo rje).<sup>3</sup> Its full title is *Chen po hor gyi yul du dam pa'i chos ji ltar byung ba'i tshul bshad pa rgyal ba'i bstan pa rin po che gsal bar byed pa'i sgron me*, i.e. "The account of the origin of the Holy Doctrine in the country of Great Mongolia, called the «Lamp Illuminating the Precious Doctrine of the Victorious One»".<sup>4</sup> The "History of Buddhism in Mongolia" was composed in the monastery Bkra shis dga' ldan bshad sgrub gling, on the 11th of the 8th month (Bhādrapada, Khrums zla ba) of the year earth-hare (sa-yos), i.e. in 1819 A.D., at the request of the Amdo bla ma Zam tsha sku zhabs rin po che 'Jigs med nam mkha' (1768–1821).<sup>5</sup> The two scribes were Gu shrī Blo bzang legs bshad dar rgyas and Gu shrī Legs bshad chos 'dzin.

<sup>1</sup> Vostrikov III §7, pp. 88–108. Cf. also Dietz 435 n. 1.

<sup>2</sup> For the details see Vostrikov, pp. 101–102, nn. 477–481; Roerich; Bira, pp. 50–55; Sagaster, pp. 68–70 and n. 63.

<sup>3</sup> On the author see Vostrikov, loc. cit.; Roerich; Ligeti HCB<sub>L</sub>, *Introduction*, p. 2ff.

<sup>4</sup> Cf. Roerich, p. 226.

<sup>5</sup> Vostrikov, n. 479.

§3. The Tibetan text of the *Hor chos 'byung* accompanied with a German translation was published by Georg Huth in 1892–1896 in two volumes. For his edition Huth used A. Schiefner's transcript of the xylograph kept in the Asiatic Museum in St. Petersburg (No. 438b). Huth also knew about another xylograph kept in St. Petersburg (Cat. no. 505).<sup>6</sup> The editor announced the third volume, never to appear, in which he planned to give the critical notes, corrections to the text, indices, etc.

It was A. Vostrikov, who first gave the correct names of the author of the *Hor chos 'byung* and his patron, and also clarified some other of Huth's mistakes (e.g. wrong chronology).<sup>7</sup> During his research trip to Inner Mongolia in 1928–31, L. Ligeti acquired a xylograph copy of the *Hor chos 'byung*. It was printed at his request in 1930 in the monastery Ch'ao yang (Tumed territory) where the printing blocks of that rare text have been preserved. The xylograph is kept now at the Oriental Library of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences.<sup>8</sup> It was reprinted by Lokesh Chandra in 1981 in the Śāta-Pitaka Series as vol. 271.

Recently (1993) the text of the *Hor chos 'byung* was published in Zi ling (Xining).

§4. The *Hor chos 'byung* is divided into two main parts: the first part consists of the description of Mongolian royal family; the second part has two large chapters: the general history of Buddhism in Mongolia, and the spread of Buddhism after Tsong kha pa's reform.<sup>9</sup>

<sup>6</sup> Huth I, p. vii. Vostrikov (Vostrikov, n. 475) identified three copies of the xylograph which were available in St. Petersburg: one kept in the Institute of Asiatic Nationalities (old collection, no. 438b) [= that one was the basis of Huth's edition], another in the Asiatic Department (no. 505), and the third in the University Library. In addition to these, Vostrikov mentioned a manuscript copy which was kept in the latter Library, made from the xylograph.

<sup>7</sup> See esp. Vostrikov n. 481: Roerich.

<sup>8</sup> Ligeti 1977, p. 56; Ligeti HCB<sub>L</sub>, *Introduction*. The present author was able to consult the microfilm of the xylograph in Budapest (MTAK No. 3565/ix): Title page: *Chen po hor gyi yul du dam pa'i chos ji ltar byung ba'i tshul bshad pa rgyal ba'i bstan pa rin po che gsal bar byed pa'i sgron me zhes bya ba bzhugs so*// Short title: *Hor chos 'byung*. Illustrations: fol. 1 (left): *bstan pa'i bdag po śākya'i rgyal*; (right): *rgyal ba gñis pa blo bzang grags*; fol. 2 (left): *'jam mgon sa skya paṇḍi ta*; (right): *rgyal dbang bsod nams rgya mtsho rje*. Begins: *na mo gu ru mañdzu nā tha ya*/ Fol. 2a3-2b1: */bstan pa zhes gsungs pa ltar skye rgu'i 'phral dang phrugs kyi phan ba de ma lus pa 'byung ba'i gnas rgyal ba'i dam chos bstan pa rin po che sog po'i yul du ji ltar byung tshul bshad pa la gñis / rgyal po'i rabs ji ltar byung tshul dang / rgyal ba'i bstan pa bstan 'dzin dang bcas pa ji ltar byung tshul dngos bshad pa'o*// Fol. 31a1-2: */gñis pa rgyal ba'i bstan pa bstan 'dzin dang bcas pa chen po hor gyi yul du ji ltar byung tshul dngos bshad pa la gñis / rgyal ba'i bstan pa rin po che ji ltar byung tshul spyir bshad pa dang / khyad par du 'jam mgon rgyal ba gñis pa btsong kha pa chen po'i bstan pa rin po che ji ltar byung tshul bshad pa'o*// Colophon: fol. 160b6-161b4 [= reproduced and translated in Roerich, pp. 226–228; cf. also Vostrikov, n. 481 on p. 273ff.]. Fol. 161b4-162a3: closing stanzas.

<sup>9</sup> See preceding note. Cf. Huth II, pp. xi–xviii.

The edition of the text from 1993 gives the following divisions into chapters:

1. *gleng gzhi* (subject of discussion).
2. *rgya gar dang bod kyi rgyal rabs rim byung gi skor* (about succession order of royal dynasties of India and Tibet),
3. *sog po'i rgyal rabs rim byung gi skor* (about succession order of royal dynasty of Mongolia),
4. *min dang ching rgyal rabs rim byung gi skor* (about succession order of royal dynasties of Ming and Ch'ing),
5. *rgyal ba'i bstan pa sog yul du dar tshul* (the way the teaching of the Victorious One spread in Mongolia),
6. *'jam mgon rgyal ba gñis pa'i bstan pa sog yul du dar tshul* (the way the teaching of the Second Victorious One, Mañjunātha [= Tsongkhapa], spread in Mongolia),
7. *ching rgyal rabs skabs sog yul du bstan pa lhag par dar tshul* (the way of further spread of teaching in Mongolia at the time of the Ch'ing royal dynasty),
8. *sog yul du skyes chen dam pa rnam byon tshul* (how the great learned men appeared in Mongolia),
9. *rgyal dbang bdun pa'i legs bshad sogs* (the elegant sayings of the seventh Dalai Lama [Blo bzang bskal bzang rgya mtsho], etc.),
10. *mjug byang* (colophon).

§5. Thanks to Schiefer's materials and notes, Huth was able to identify numerous quotations from Sa skya paṇḍita's and Nāgārjuna's works.<sup>10</sup> Of the former, they come from the *Subhāṣitaratnanidhi* (*Legs par bshad pa rin po che'i gter*),<sup>11</sup> of the latter, they come from two works: the *Prajñāśatakanāmaprakaraṇa* (*Shes rab brgya ba zhes bya ba'i rab tu byed pa*, P Tanjur 5820, mdo, Go. 140b-145a),<sup>12</sup> and the *Nītiśāstraprajñādaṇḍa* (*Lugs kyi bcos shes rab sdong bu*, P Tanjur 5821, mdo, Go. 145a-156b).<sup>13</sup>

Among many quotations of sayings from Śrīnātha Nāgārjuna, Sa skya paṇḍita, and a few others (e.g. Śāntideva, Zhi ba lha), there are also found seven quotations from Vasubandhu (Dbyig gñen), a famous Buddhist philosopher of the fifth century.<sup>14</sup>

§6. The "History of Buddhism" by Bu ston (1290-1364) from 1322 A.D. is a well-known work of a great erudite.<sup>15</sup>

<sup>10</sup> Huth II, pp. xxviii-xxxi.

<sup>11</sup> Cf. Ligeti 1948, p. vii.

<sup>12</sup> Not mentioned among the works ascribed to Nāgārjuna in Lindtner.

<sup>13</sup> "Perhaps authentic...", Lindtner, p. 14 n. 29.

<sup>14</sup> Dharmatāla in his "Rosary of White Lotus" from 1889 A.D. three times quotes the Abhidharmakośa: VIII.39a-b, VIII.38c-d, and V.44. Two first quotations correspond to the *Hor chos 'byung* fragments 2 and 5, respectively (see below).

<sup>15</sup> See Szerb, *Introduction*.

Bu ston quoted many texts, both canonical sūtras and exegetical śāst<sub>ras</sub>, but especially often he referred to the two works of Vasubandhu: *Abhidhar-makośa* and *Vyākhyāyukti*.<sup>16</sup> It seems that the author of the *Hor chos 'byung* followed Bu ston's *Chos 'byung*, at least to some extent, and took also from Bu ston's work most of his references to Vasubandhu's works.<sup>17</sup>

The present contribution, dedicated in honour of Professor Klaus Sagaster on the occasion of his 65th birthday, is devoted to the identification and brief analysis of the seven quotations from Vasubandhu's works (and one from Śāntideva) which are found in the *Hor chos 'byung*. (It is needless to say that Huth failed to identify the quotations from Vasubandhu, and his translation of the passages is often unreliable.)

### Acknowledgments

It is my great pleasure to acknowledge the help which I derived from Mr Thupten Kunga, Oriental Institute, Warsaw University; Dr Agata Bareja-Starzyńska, Warsaw University; Dr. M. Torsten Much-Wieser and Ms. Katharina Wieser, Vienna, now in Budapest; the staff of the Oriental Library, Academy of Sciences, Budapest.

### (1) = VyY Si. 40b1ff.

[Huth I,61.8-62.1 = HCB 76. 16-77.1 = HCB<sub>L</sub> 34b2-6] *de ltar na spyir chos zhes bya ba'i sgra ni don bcu la 'jug ste / kun mkhyen gñis pa Dbyig gñen gyi zhal nas /*

*chos ni shes bya lam dang ni /  
mya ngan 'das dang yid kyi yul /  
bsod nams tshe dang gsung rab dang /  
'byung 'gyur nges dang chos lugs la'o /*

<sup>16</sup> Bu ston mentioned eight treatises (*prakaraṇa*) of Vasubandhu, and among them he distinguished five independent treatises: *Triṃśikā*, *Viṃśatikā*, *Pañcaskandhaprakaraṇa*, *Vyākhyāyukti*, and *Karmasiddhiprakaraṇa*. He characterized VyY as a work on idealism, which shows the adequacy of preaching and learning of the doctrine. Bu ston [Ya. 21b7-22a2 = p. 674-5; Obermiller I, 57]: *dbyig gñen gyi rab tu byed pa sde brgyad ni / chos thams cad sems tsam du ston pa sum cu pa / de rigs pas sgrub pa ñi shu pa / de'i gzhi phung po lnga 'thad par ston pa phung po lnga pa / de ltar yin yang bshad ñan 'thad par ston pa [//] rnam bshad rigs pa / sgo gsum gyi las 'thad par ston pa las grub pa'i rab tu byed pa ste </> rang rgyud du brtsams pa lnga /*

<sup>17</sup> On the sources of the *Hor chos 'byung* see Vostrikov, loc. cit.; Roerich; Ligeti HCB<sub>L</sub>, *Introduction*; Sagaster, loc. cit.

*zhes 'byung ba ltar la / de yang mdo las / chos rnam s thams cad de 'drar shes  
par gyis / zhes pa shes bya dang / yang dag pa'i lta ba ni chos yin no // zhes pa  
lam dang / chos la skyabs su song ba zhes pa myang 'das dang / chos kyi skye  
mched ces pa yid yul dang / btsun mo'i 'khor dang gzhon nu rnam s dang lhan cig  
chos spyod ces pa bsod nam s dang / byis pa ni mthong ba'i chos gces par 'dzin  
zhes pa tshe dang / chos zhes pa ni 'di lta ste / mdo'i sde dang / dbyangs kyis  
bsñad pa'i sde dang zhes pa gsung rab dang / lus 'di rgas pa'i chos yin no zhes  
pa 'byung 'gyur dang / dge sbyong gi chos zhes pa nges pa dang / yul chos dang  
rigs chos zhes pa chos lugs te bcu la 'jug pa'o //*

### Translation

“Thus, in general, the word *dharma* is put into ten meanings, as it was said by the second Omniscient,<sup>18</sup> Vasubandhu –

«[The word] *dharma* [is put] in [the meaning of] phenomenon of existence, the path, *nirvāṇa*, object of the mind, virtue, lifetime, [Buddha's] teachings, characteristic of becoming, religious vow, and religious tradition.»

Thus, it was said in the *Sūtra*: «Though [he] knows all the *dharma*s (phenomena) like that...» — [in the sense of] phenomena of existence (cognizable things, *jñeya*);<sup>19</sup> «...the right view is *dharma*» — [in the sense of the] path; «he went for refuge to the *dharma*» — [in the sense of final liberation,] *nirvāṇa*; «the basis of cognition of the *dharma*s» — [in the sense of the] object of mind; «the ladies attending the queen and young men mutually behave with *dharma*» — [in the sense of] virtue; «a fool holds dear the visible things (*dharma*s)» — [in the sense of the present] lifetime; «*dharma* means the religious discourses and the verse utterances» — [in the sense of the] Buddha's teachings; «this body is a *dharma* (characteristic of coming into being) of ageing» — [in the sense of the characteristic of] coming into being; «*dharma* (duties) of a monk ascetic» — [in the sense of] the religious vow; «*dharma* of the country and *dharma* of social class» — [in the sense of] the religious tradition.”<sup>20</sup>

### Comment

The passage is found in Bu ston's *Chos 'byung* as a quotation from Vasubandhu's VyY. The following explanations on the tenfold meaning of the word *dharma*, which were put at length in VyY, Bu ston took out in an abbreviated form (underlined are the words taken verbatim from VyY).

<sup>18</sup> Cf. Yaśomitra, AKVy ad I.1.

<sup>19</sup> It should be noted that the explanation of the first meaning of the word *dharma* is different in the *Hor chos 'byung* from the original in VyY.

<sup>20</sup> Cf. Huth II.92.16-93.1.

(*Bu ston*, Ya. 7a4-7b1 = p. 645; *Obermiller* I.18 n. 142, cf. n. 144): *chos shes pa'i sgra de don bcu la 'jug ste / rnam bshad rigs par / chos ni shes bya lam dang ni // mya ngan 'das dang yid kyi yul // bsod nams tshe dang gsung rab dang // 'byung 'gyur nges dang chos lugs la'o // zhes pas / chos gang la la 'dus byas sam 'dus ma byas sam zhes pa shes bya dang / yang dag pa'i lta ba ni chos yin no zhes pa lta lam dang / chos la skyabs su song ba zhes pa myang 'das dang / chos kyi skye mched ces pa yid yul dang / btsun mo'i 'khor dang gzhon nu rnams dang lhan cig chos spyod ces pa bsod nams dang / byis pa ni mthong ba'i chos gces par 'dzin pa yin zhes pa tshe dang / chos shes pa ni / 'di lta ste / mdo'i sde dang zhes pa lta bu gsung rab dang / lus 'di rgas pa'i chos yin no zhes pa 'byung 'gyur dang / [Ya. 7b1; 646] dge slong gi chos bzhi zhes pa lta bu nges pa dang / yul chos rigs chos shes pa chos lugs te / bcu la 'jug go /*

And here is the full text from the *Vyākhyāyukti*, P Tanjur, Si. 40b2-41a2:

*chos ni shes bya lam dang ni /  
mya ngan 'das dang yid kyi yul /  
bsod nams tshe dang gsung rab dang /  
'byung 'gyur (3) nges dang chos lugs la'o //*

*chos kyi sgra <shes bya> zhes bya ba la ni chos gang la la 'dus byas sam 'dus ma byas sam de rnams kyi mchog ni 'dod chags dang bral ba yin par bshad do zhes 'byung (4) ba lta bu'o // lam la ni dge slong dag log pa'i lta ba ni chos ma yin la yang dag pa'i lta ba ni chos yin no zhes rgyas par 'byung ba lta bu'o // mya ngan las 'das pa la ni chos la skyabs su song (5) ba zhes 'byung ba lta bu'o // yid kyi yul la ni chos kyi skye mched ces 'byung ba lta bu ste / de ni yid kho na'i yul yin zhing yul kho na yin gyi rten ni ma yin no // bsod nams la ni btsun mo'i (6) 'khor dang gzhon nu rnams dang lhan cig tu chos spyod ces rgyas par 'byung ba lta bu'o // tshe 'di la ni mthong ba'i chos la myong bar 'gyur ba dang / byis pa ni mthong ba'i chos gces par 'dzin pa (7) yin zhes 'byung ba lta bu'o // gsung rab la ni 'di la dge slong chos shes pa ni 'di lta ste / mdo'i sde dang / dbyangs kyis bsñad pa'i sde dang zhes rgya cher 'byung ba lta bu'o // 'byung bar 'gyur (8) ba la ni 'du byed kyi rdzas rnams ni de'i chos so zhes 'byung ba dang / de lta 'di lta ste / lus 'di ni rga ba'i chos yin no zhes 'byung ba lta bu'o // nges pa la ni dge slong gi chos bzhi rnam<s zh>es 'byung ba dang / [41a1] de bzhin du dge slong dag srog gcod pa ni chos ma yin la srog gcod pa spong ba ni chos yin no zhes rgya cher 'byung ba lta bu'o // chos lugs la ni yul chos dang rigs chos (2) zhes 'byung ba lta bu'o //*

#### Translation

“The word *dharma* [can be used in the following ten meanings, viz.] (1) in the sense of the *cognizable* [objects, *jñeya* = phenomena, *dharma*], like in [the sentence] «The most excellent among any one of the *dharmas* [= cognizable phe-

nomena], are they conditioned (*saṃskṛta*) or unconditioned (*asaṃskṛta*), is said to be free from passion.»

(2) [In the sense of the] *path*, like in [the sentence] «Monks, the false view is not the *dharma*, the right view is the *dharma*.»

(3) [In the sense of the final liberation,] *nirvāṇa*, like in [the sentence] «He went for refuge to the *dharma*.»

(4) [In the sense of the] *object of mind*, like in [the expression] «The basis of cognition of the *dharma*s»; [therefore] it is just the object of mind, and, while it is just the object, it is not the basis (support).

(5) [In the sense of] *virtue*, like in [the sentence] «The ladies attending the queen and young men mutually (with one another) behave with virtue.»

(6) [In the sense of] *this lifetime*, like in [the sentence] «What is experienced in the visible world [= present life]», and «A fool holds dear the visible world.»

(7) [In the sense of the] *Buddha's teachings*, like in [the sentence] «Here, monks, *dharma* means religious discourse(s) (*sūtra*) and verse utterance(s) (*geya*).»<sup>21</sup>

(8) [In the sense of the characteristic of] *coming into being*, like in [the sentence] «The substances of the conditioned factors are its *dharma*», and therefore it is said that «This body is a *dharma* of ageing».

(9) [In the sense of the] *religious vow*, like in [the sentence] «There are four duties of a monk», and therefore it was said «Monks, taking of the life is not *dharma*, [whereas] abandonment of taking of the life is *dharma*.»

(10) [In the sense of the] *religious tradition*, like in [the sentence] «[There are two kinds of religious tradition, viz.] tradition of a country, and tradition of a [social] class.»

(2) = AK VIII.39a-b

[Huth I, 63.3-9, 64.3-7 = HCB 78.18-79.6, 80.2-6 = HCB<sub>L</sub> 35b1-3, 36a1-3] *dam pa'i chos sangs rgyas kyi bstan pa de la dbye na / slob dpon Dbyig gñen gyis / ston pa'i dam chos rnam gñis te / lung dang rtogs pa'i bdag ñid do //*

*zhes gsungs pa ltar lung gi bstan pa dang / rtogs pa'i bstan pa gñis yod / lung gi bstan pa la sangs rgyas kyis gsungs pa'i bka' dang / mkhas grub dam pa rnams kyis brtsams pa'i bstan bcos gñis yod / bka' la sde snod gsum dang / rgyud sde bzhi yod la / (...) / rtogs pa'i bstan pa la ni / tshul khrims kyi bslab pa dang / ting nge 'dzin gyi bslab pa dang / shes rab kyi bslab pa ste lhag pa'i bslab pa gsum dang / mtshan bcas mtshan med kyi rnal 'byor dang / bskyed rim dang rdzogs rim gyi rnal 'byor dang / sa bcu dang / lam lnga la sogs pa rnams 'jog go /*

<sup>21</sup> Cf. VyY Si. 96b8-97a3.

### Translation

“When classifying the Good Law, the Doctrine of the Buddha, so — as it was said by Vasubandhu — it is twofold: Doctrine and Spiritual Realization —

«The Good Law of the Teacher is twofold, consisting of Doctrine (*āgama*) and Spiritual Realization (*adhigama*).»<sup>22</sup>

(a) [Now] the two kinds of Doctrine are: the words spoken by the Buddha (*buddhavacana*), and the treatises (*śāstra*) composed by the excellent scholars. The words [of the Buddha] consist of the three baskets (*tripiṭaka*) and the four tantras. (...) [Here comes the explanation of the word *śāstra* — see below, fragment no. 3.]

(b) Spiritual Realization consists of three kinds of higher training (*śikṣā*)<sup>23</sup>, viz. [training] in moral conduct (*śīla*), in meditation (*samādhi*), and in wisdom (*prajñā*); [moreover, training] in yoga with signs (*sanimitta*), in yoga without signs (*animitta*), in yoga of generation stage (*utpattikrama*), and in yoga of completion stage (*saṃpannakrama*), [as well as in] ten stages (*daśabhūmi*), five paths (*pañcagati*), etc.”

### Comment

The passage comes from Vasubandhu's AK VIII.39a-b. The AKBh explains that *āgama* means Sūtra, Vinaya, and Abhidharma, i.e. the Tripiṭaka, and *adhigama* means the factors of enlightenment (ed. Pradhan 459.9 [= P Ngū. 93a6]):

*saddharmo dvividhaḥ śāstur āgamādhigamātmakaḥ /*

[10] *tatrāgamah sūtravinayābhidarmā adhigamo bodhipakṣyā ity eṣa dvividhaḥ saddharmah /*<sup>24</sup>

It is also quoted and explained in B u s t o n's *Chos 'byung*<sup>25</sup> (B u s t o n, Ya. fol. 8a7, 8b5 = p. 647, 648; Obermiller I, 21, 22, nn. 164, 165): *de la dbye na / rtogs pa'i chos dang / lung gi chos gñis te / mdzod las / ston pa'i dam chos rnam gñis te // lung dang rtogs pa'i bdag ñid do // zhes pas / rtogs pa'i chos kyi mtshan ñid / gang zhib gang gis 'dod chags dang bral ba ste / (...) / lung gi chos kyi mtshan ñid ni / rtogs pa'i chos la 'jug pa'i rjod byed do //*

<sup>22</sup> Cf. Huth II, 97.6-11. On these two terms see BHS s.v.

<sup>23</sup> Cf. BHS s.v.: *adhiśīla*, *adhicitta*, *adhiprajñā*.

<sup>24</sup> Cf. LVP, Kośa, VIII, p. 218 & n. 5, 6; p. 219 n. 1, 2.

<sup>25</sup> The stanza was also quoted by Dharmatāla (Tibetan text, fol. 83b6-83a2 = p. 166-167; Romanized text, p. 80; Klafkowski 1987, p. 152). [The references to page numbering of the Tibetan xylograph edition should be corrected both in the Romanized text edition and in Klafkowski's translation (Klafkowski 1987) by adding one, e.g. instead of p. 166 read: p. 167, etc. Here I give the original folio numbers and the corrected page numbering.]



(3) = VY Si. 143a5ff.

[Huth I, 63.14-64.3 = HCB 79.12-80.1 = HCB<sub>L</sub> 35b5-36a3] *bstan bcos zhes pa*  
(HCB: *zhes bya ba*) *ni 'chos dang skyob pa'i yon tan gñis dang ldan te / slob dpon*

**Dbyig gñen gyis /**

*ñon mongs dgra rnam ma lus 'chos pa dang /*

*ngan 'gro'i srid las skyob pa gang yin pa /*

*'chos skyob yon tan phyir na bstan bcos te /*

*gñis po 'di dag gzhan gyi lugs la med (Huth: sed) /*

*ces gsungs pa ltar rgyu'i skabs su rang ñams su blang ba'i skye bo'i dug [64]*

*gsum dang ñes spyod las 'chos zhing (HCB: shing) / 'bras bu ngan song 'khor bas*

*mtshon pa'i rgud pa mtha' dag las skyob pas na bstan bcos zhes bya ba'o // des*

*na bka' yang bstan bcos su shes par bya'o //*

**Translation**

“It has two qualities of making (*śās*, ruling) and protecting (*trā*), [that is why] it is called *śāstra* (treatise), as it was said by Vasubandhu:

«What makes (*'chos pa*) without remainder the foes, i.e. the afflictions, and protects (*skyob pa*) from existence and poor destiny, this is called *śāstra* (*bstan bcos*) [‘treatise’], because it has the qualities of making-and-protecting. These two [qualities] are not [to be found elsewhere] in the other systems of thought.»

It is called *śāstra* (treatise), because — when [it is] a cause — it makes [free] from the committed moral faults and three moral poisons of a sentient being which takes it to the heart itself, and because — [when it is] a result — it protects from all [kinds of] decline marked by the round [of transmigration] of those gone into damnation. Therefore also the words [of the Buddha] (*buddhavaṇa*) should be known as a *śāstra*.<sup>26</sup>

**Comment**

The passage comes from VyY and it is found in Bu ston's *Chos 'byung*. It correponds *verbatim* to VyY P Si. 143a4-6 (Bu ston, Ya. 16b1-3 = p. 664; Obermiller I, 42, nn. 398, 399): / **rnam bshad rigs par / sangs rgyas kyi**  
*gsung bstan bcos kyi mtshan ñid du 'thad pa'i phyir ro // nges pa'i tshig du [ma]*  
(VyY om. *ma*) *'chos pa dang (VyY: /) skyob par byed pas (VyY: /) de'i phyir*  
*bstan bcos so // ñon mongs dgra rnam ma lus 'chos pa dang // ngan 'gro srid*  
*las skyob pa gang yin te // 'chos skyob yon tan phyir na bstan bcos te // gñis po*

<sup>26</sup> Cf. Huth II, 98.12-99.5.

'di dag gzhan gyi lugs la med // de lta bas na sangs rgyas kyi gsung kho na don  
dam par bstan bcos yin pas 'chos pa dang (VyY: /) skyob pa'i yon tan gyi phyir  
yang don gzung (VyY: bzung) ba la 'bad pa dang ldan par bya'o // zhes gsungs  
so //

### Translation

“The sayings of the Buddha [are *śāstra*], because they conform to the characteristic of the *śāstra*. (Stanza.) Therefore, the sayings of the Buddha, because they are the *śāstra* in the highest sense, due to the quality of making (*śās*, ruling) and protecting (*trā*), should be assiduously applied. So it was said in the *Vyākhyāyukti*.”<sup>27</sup>

### Comment

Obermiller (loc. cit.) noticed that the stanza was quoted by Candrakīrti in his *Prasannapadā* (ed. LVP, 3. 3-4).<sup>28</sup> Moreover, the stanza is also found in Sthiramati's gloss on the *Madhyānta-vibhāga* (ed. Pandeya 4.11-20):

*yacchāsti ca kleśaripūn aśeṣān*  
*santrāyate durgatito bhavāc ca /*  
*tacchāsanāt trāṇaguṇāc ca śāstram*  
*etad dvayaṃ cānyamateṣu nāsti //*<sup>29</sup>

### (4) = AK VIII.43

[Huth I, 277.8-13 = HCB 353.5-9 = HCB<sub>L</sub> 156b5-6] *slob dpon Dbyig gñeu gyis/*

*de ltar thub pa dag gi (AK: gis) bstan pa ni /*  
*lkog mar srog phyin 'dra dang dri ma rnams /*  
*stobs dang ldan pa'i dus su rig nas ni /*  
*thar ba (Huth: pa) 'dod pa dag gis bag yod gyis (Huth: kyis) /*  
*ces gsungs pas so //*

<sup>27</sup> Cf. Vasubandhu's definition in AKBh I.1: *śiṣyaśāsanāc chāstram*, and Yaśomitra's gloss (AKVy ad I.1): *arthaviśeṣābhidyotako nāmasamūhaḥ śāstram*.

<sup>28</sup> Cf. Stcherbatsky 1927, p. 84: “It rules over all our enemies, our passions. It saves us from the misery and from phenomenal existence (altogether). Those two advantages are not to be found in other philosophic doctrines.”

<sup>29</sup> Identified in Stcherbatsky 1936, p. 7, n. 47.

**Translation**

“It was said by Vasubandhu:

«Thus, having known [that] the teaching of the Ascetic is, like the life, gone into throat, and the impurities are strong at that time, those desiring liberation are being conscientious (diligent).»<sup>30</sup>

**Comment**

The passage comes from AK VIII.43 (ed. Pradhan 460.12-13 [P Ngu. 83b5-6]):

*iti kaṅṭhagataprāṇaṃ viditvā śāsanaṃ muneḥ /  
balakālaṃ malānāṃ ca na pramādyāṃ mumukṣubhiḥ //*

“Thus, after having known [that] the teaching of the [Great] Ascetic is, like the lifebreath, going out through the throat, and [that it is] the time of [growing of] the power of the impurities, those who are striving for liberation should not be negligent.”<sup>31</sup>

**(5) = AK VIII.39c-d**

[Huth I, 279.18-280.4 = HCB 357.2-8 = HCB<sub>L</sub> 158b3-5] *dam pa'i chos de 'dzin  
tshul ni / slob dpon chen po Dbyig gñen gyis /  
de 'dzin byed pa smra byed dang /  
sgrub par byed pa kho na yin /*

[280] *zhes gsungs pa ltar lung gi dam chos phyin ci ma log par gzhan la (Huth:  
gzhal) smra ba'am 'chad par byed pa de lung gi dam chos 'dzin pa'i tshad yin la /  
rtogs pa'i dam chos phyin ci ma log par sgrub par byed pa de rtogs pa'i dam chos  
'dzin pa'i tshad yin no //*

**Translation**

“As regards the way of keeping the Holy Doctrine, as it was said by the great master Vasubandhu:

«Its supporters are those who preserve [it] and those who remember [it].»<sup>32</sup>

<sup>30</sup> Cf. Huth II, 436.12.

<sup>31</sup> Cf. LVP, *Kośa*, VIII, p. 224 & n. 1: *evaṃ kaṅṭhagataprāṇaṃ viditvā munīśāsanam / malānāṃ balakālaṃ ca na pramādyāṃ mumukṣubhiḥ //* “Voyant que la loi du Muni est à son dernier souffle, que c’est l’heure de la force des vices, ceus qui désirent la délivrance doivent être diligents.”

<sup>32</sup> Cf. Huth II, 440.1-11.

[Those who] explain or relate to the others correctly the Holy Doctrine, are the right measure (norm) of keeping the Holy Doctrine (*āgama*); [those who] realize correctly the Spiritual Realization (*adhigama*), are the right measure (norm) of keeping the Spiritual Realization.”

### Comment

The passage comes from AK VIII.39c-d (ed. Pradhan 459.11 [= P Ngu. 93<sub>a7</sub>]:

*dhātāras tasya vaktāraḥ pratipattāra eva ca //*

[12] *āgamasya hi dhārayitāro vaktāraḥ / adhigamasya pratipattāraḥ /*<sup>33</sup>

“«Its supporters are those who preach [it] and those who practice [it]».

For the supporters of the Doctrine are the preachers, and [the supporters of] the Spiritual Realization are the practitioners.”

The stanza is found in Bu ston's *Chos 'byung*<sup>34</sup> (Bu ston, Ya. 5b7 ≈ p. 642; Obermiller I, 15 n. 116): / *bshad ñan ni / bstan pa'am chos 'dzin par 'gyur te / mdzod las / de 'dzin byed pa smra byed pa // sgrub par byed pa kho na yin // zhes so // chos 'dzin pa'i phan yon bsam gyis mi khyab ste /*

### (6) = AK IV.125a-b; Śikṣāsamuccaya ad 26

[Huth I, 280.4-11 = HCB 357.8-15 HCB<sub>L</sub> 158b5-6] / *de yang chos bshad pa'i phan yon 'thob pa la / slob dpon Dbyig gñen gyis /*

*chos sbyin ñon mongs can min pas /*

*mdo sogs yang dag ji bzhin ston/*

*zhes dang / slog dpon chen po Zhi ba lhas kyang /*

*chos kyi sbyin pa zang zing med /*

*bsod nams 'phel ba'i rgyu yin no //*

*zhes gsungs pa ltar rñed bkur la chags pa sogs kyi ñon mongs pa dang ma 'dres shing / gang bshad par bya ba'i chos de'i tshig don ma nor bar ston pa dgos so //*

### Translation

“They also obtain the benefit of preaching the Doctrine, as it was said by the master Vasubandhu:

«The gift of Doctrine it is undefiled right teaching of the sūtras, etc.», and also it was said by the great master Śāntideva:

<sup>33</sup> Cf. LVP, *Kośa*, VIII, p. 219 & n. 2.

<sup>34</sup> The stanza was also quoted by Dharmatāla (Tibetan text, fol. 85b1 = p. 170; Romanized text, p. 81f.; Klafkowski 1987 p. 155 [translation misses the point]).

«The gift of Doctrine which is free from worldliness is the cause of increase of virtue.»

Being not mixed with the misery of attachment to the riches and honours, etc., [they] should teach without mistake the meaning of the words of the Doctrine (Scripture) which is to be explained.”<sup>35</sup>

### Comment

The first passage — by Vasubandhu — is found in AK IV.125a-b (ed. Pradhan 274.15 [= P Gu. 263b7-8]):

*dharmadānaṃ yathābhūta(m)sūtrādyakliṣṭadeśanā //*  
*sūtrādīnāṃ yathābhūtam akliṣṭadeśanā dharmadānam //*<sup>36</sup>

“«The gift of Doctrine it is undefiled right teaching of the *sūtras*, etc.», i.e. the gift of Doctrine it is undefiled teaching according to the truth of the *sūtras* and other [religious predicts].”

The second passage comes from Śāntideva's commentary on his *kārikā* 26 of the *Śikṣāsamuccaya* (ed. Bendall, p. 350.25): *dharmadānaṃ nirāmiṣaṃ puṇyavṛddhinimittam bhavati /*. It is not a verse here, but the Tibetan authors deemed it to be such (see below)! The *kārikā* 26 is as follows (ibid. p. xlvii):

*sarvāvasthāsu sattvārtho dharmadānaṃ nirāmiṣam /*  
*bodhicittam ca puṇyasya vṛddhihetuḥ samāsataḥ //*  
*dus rnam s kun tu sems can don /*  
*chos kyi sbyin pa zang zing med /*  
*byang chub sems ni mdor bsdu na /*  
*bsod nams 'phel ba'i rgyu yin no //*

“The gift of Doctrine, free from worldliness (*nirāmiṣa*)<sup>37</sup>, is the gain of living being in all situations (conditions). In short: the thought of enlightenment is the cause of increase of virtue.”

The quotation from Śāntideva is found in Bu ston's *Chos 'byung* (Bu ston, Ya. fol. 5a6 = p. 641: Obermiller I, 13 & n. 96): *bslab btus las / chos kyi sbyin pa zang zing med // bsod nams 'phel ba'i rgyu yin no // zhes so //*.

### (7) = AK VI.5a-b

[Huth I, 280.11-18 = HCB 357.15-258.5 = HCB<sub>L</sub> 159a1-4] *dam pa'i chos de thos bsam sgom pa'i sgo nas nams su blang bar byed pa rnam kyang / slob dpon Dbyig gñen gyis /*

<sup>35</sup> Cf. Huth II, 440.12-27.

<sup>36</sup> Cf. LVP, *Kośa*, IV, p. 252 & n. 1.

<sup>37</sup> See BHSD s. v. and sub *āmiṣa*.

*tshul gnas thos dang bsam ldan pas (AK: pa) /  
sgom (AK: bsgom) pa la ni rab tu sbyor /  
zhes gsungs pa ltar rnam par mi gyeng ba'i rgyu so thar gyi tshul khrims la legs  
par gnas te / mi rmongs pa'i rgyu dam pa'i chos tshul bzhin du ñan nas thos  
byung gi shes rab bskyed / de nas gtan la 'bebs pa'i rgyu bsam byung gi shes rab  
dang ldan pas / sgrib pa dang bral ba'i rgyu sgom pa la ni rab tu sbyor ba las  
sang rgyas kyi sar thogs pa med par bgrod par 'gyur ro //*

### Translation

“The Holy Doctrine is to be taken to the heart by means of listening, thinking and meditating, as it was said by the master Vasubandhu:

«One who is established in practice, learned and reflecting upon, can apply oneself to meditation.»<sup>38</sup>

One who is well established in the moral duties of the code of discipline (*prātimokṣa*)<sup>39</sup>, which is the cause of not being disturbed by anything, [he] produces wisdom originated from listening duly to the Holy Doctrine, which is the cause of non-delusion; then, possessed with wisdom originated from thinking, which is the cause of putting [all things] in order, after having applied into meditation, which is the cause of separation from the defilements, one comes unimpeded to the Buddha's sphere.”

### Comment

The passage is found in AK VI.5a-b (ed. Pradhan 334.15 [= AK Ngu. 9a6-7]):  
*vṛttasthaḥ śrutacintāvān bhāvanāyāṃ prayujyate //*<sup>40</sup>

“One who is firm in practice, listening and thinking [about the Doctrine], applies into meditation.”

## Abbreviations and Bibliography

AK(Bh) = *Abhidharmakośa(-bhāṣya)*

AKBh (Pradhan) = *Abhidharmakośabhāṣyam of Vasubandhu*. Deciphered and edited by Prahlad Pradhan. Revised with Introduction and Indices by Aruna Halder. Patna 1975. Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series 8.

AKVy = *Abhidharmakośa-vyākhyā* (Yaśomitra)

<sup>38</sup> Cf. Huth II, 440.28-441.7.

<sup>39</sup> Cf. BHSD s.v.

<sup>40</sup> Cf. LVP, Kośa, VI, p. 142 & n. 4: “Fixé dans son devoir professionnel, muni de l'enseignement et de la réflexion, il sera capable de s'adonner à la contemplation.”

- BHSD = *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary*, by F. Edgerton, New Haven 1953.
- Bira = Bira, Sh., *Mongolian Historical Literature of the XVII–XIX Centuries Written in Tibetan*. Ed. Ts. Damdinsüren. Transl. from the Russian by Stanley N. Frye. Bloomington 1970.
- Bu ston = Bu ston Rin chen grub [1290–1364], *Bde bar gshegs pa'i bstan pa'i gsal byed chos kyi 'byung gnas gsung rab rin po che'i mdzod ces bya ba*. In: *Collected Works of Bu ston*. Part 24 (Ya). Edited by Lokesh Chandra. New Delhi 1971, pp. 633–1055 [= Ya. fol. 1–212].
- Dharmatāla = *Chen po hor gyi yul du dam pa'i chos ji ltar dar ba'i tshul gsal bar br jod pa padma dkar po'i phreng ba*. = *Dharmatāla's Annals of Buddhism*, facsimile ed. by Lokesh Chandra. Delhi 1975. Śata-Pitaka Series 225. [Reproduced from a Buryat copy, lacking 11 ff. which were substituted by modern handwriting. Correct the page order: 371-372-369-370. See also my note supra.]  
= *History of Buddhism in Mongolia*, ed. by Lokesh Chandra. Delhi 1977. Śata-Pitaka Series 253. [Romanized ed. of the above.]
- Dietz = Dietz, Siglinde, "Cosmogony as Presented in Tibetan Historical Literature and its Sources" in: *Tibetan Studies*. Proceedings of the 5th Seminar of the International Association of Tibetan Studies, Narita 1989. Narita 1992, pp. 435–438.
- HCB = *Chen po hor gyi yul du dam pa'i chos ji ltar byung ba'i tshul bshad pa rgyal ba'i bstan pa rin po che gsal bar byed pa'i sgron me zhes bya ba bzhugs so // 'Jigs med rig pa'i rdo rjes brtsams / Mtsho sngon mi rigs dpe skrun khang / 1993 Zi ling /*
- HCBL = *Chen po Hor gyi yul dam pa'i chos ji ltar byung ba'i tshul bshad pa Bstan pa rin po che gsal bar byed pa'i sgron me*, Xylograph 162 ff. Ligeti Collection 6 = MTAK Tib. 259, Budapest.  
= Reproduced, with an *Introduction* by L. Ligeti, by Lokesh Chandra, New Delhi 1981, as Śata-Pitaka Series Vol. 271.
- Huth I = *Geschichte des Buddhismus in der Mongolei*. Aus dem Tibetischen des 'Jigs-med nam-mk'a herausgegeben, übersetzt und erläutert von Dr. Georg Huth. Erster Teil: Vorrede. Text. Kritische Anmerkungen. Strassburg 1892. S. x + 296.
- Huth II = *Geschichte des Buddhismus in der Mongolei*. Mit einer Einleitung: Politische Geschichte der Mongolen. Aus dem Tibetischen des 'Jigs-med nam-mk'a herausgegeben, übersetzt und erläutert von Dr. Georg Huth. Zweiter Teil: Nachträge zum ersten Teil. Übersetzung. Strassburg 1896. S. xxxii + 456.
- Index AKBh = Hirakawa Akira, et al., *Index to the Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*. Part III. Tibetan-Sanskrit. Tokyo 1978.
- Klafkowski 1987 = *Rosary of White Lotuses, being the Clear Account of How the Precious Teaching of Buddha Appeared and Spread in the Great Hor Country*. Translated and annotated by P. Klafkowski. Supervised by Nyalo Trulku Jampa Kelzang Rinpoche, Wiesbaden 1987. Asiatische Forschungen 95.
- Klafkowski 1979 = Klafkowski, Piotr, *The Secret Deliverance of the Sixth Dalai Lama as Narrated by Dharmatāla*. Wien 1979. Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde, Heft 3.
- Ligeti 1977 = Ligeti, Louis, *Rapport préliminaire d'un voyage d'exploration fait en Mongolie chinoise 1928–1931*. Budapest 1977 (reprint).
- Ligeti 1948 = Ligeti, Louis, *Le Subhāṣitaratnanidhi mongol. Un document du moyen mongol*. Partie I<sup>re</sup>. Le manuscrit tibéto-mongol en reproduction phototypique avec une introduction. Budapest 1948. Bibliotheca Orientalis Hungarica VI.
- Lindtner = Lindtner, Christian, *Nagarjuniana. Studies in the Writings and Philosophy of Nāgārjuna*. Copenhagen 1982. Indiske Studier 4.

- LVP, Kośa = La Vallée Poussin, Louis de, *L'Abhidharmakośa de Vasubandhu*, trad. et annoté. Paris-Louvain 1923–1931. Repr. Bruxelles 1980.
- Madhyānta-vibhāga* = *Madhyānta-vibhāga-śāstra*. Containing the Kārikā-s of Maitreya. Bhāṣya of Vasubandhu and ṭīkā by Sthiramati. Crit. ed. by Ramchandra Pandeya. Delhi 1971.
- Obermiller = *History of Buddhism (Chos-ḥbyung) by Bu ston*. I. Part: *The Jewelry of Scripture*. II. Part: *The History of Buddhism in India and Tibet*. Translated from Tibetan by Dr. E. Obermiller. Heidelberg 1931–32. Materialien zur Kunde des Buddhismus 18–19.
- P = Peking edition of the Kanjur and Tanjur
- Prasannapadā* = *Mūlamadhyamakakārikās (Mādhyamikasūtras) de Nāgārjuna avec la Prasannapadā Commentaire de Candrakīrti*, ed. L. de La Vallée Poussin. St.-Petersbourg 1903–1913. Bibliotheca Buddhica 4.
- Roerich = Roerich, Y.N., "The Author of the Hor-chos-hbyun", *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* 1946, pp. 192–196; repr. in: *Izbrannye trudy*, Moscow 1967, pp. 225–229.
- Sagaster = Sagaster, Klaus, *Subud Erike. Ein Rosenkranz aus Perlen*. Die Biographie des 1. Pekinger ICang skya Khutukhtu Ngag dbang blo bzang chos ldan, verfaßt von Ngag dbang chos ldan alias Shes rab dar rgyas. Wiesbaden 1968. Asiatische Forschungen 20.
- Śikṣāsamuccaya* = *Śikṣāsamuccaya. A Compendium of Buddhistic Teaching compiled by Śāntideva chiefly from earlier Mahāyāna-sūtras*. Ed. by Cecil Bendall. St.-Petersburg 1897–1902. Reprinted by Meicho-Fukyū-Kai, Tokyo 1977.
- Stcherbatsky 1927 = Stcherbatsky, Th., *The Conception of Buddhist Nirvāṇa*. Leningrad 1927.
- Stcherbatsky 1936 = *Madhyānta-vibhanga. Discourse on Discrimination Between Middle and Extremes, ascribed to Bodhisattva Maitreya and commented by Vasubandhu and Sthiramati*. Translated from the Sanscrit by Th. Stcherbatsky. Leningrad 1936. Bibliotheca Buddhica XXX.
- Szerb = Szerb, János †, *Bu ston's History of Buddhism in Tibet*. Critically edited with a comprehensive index. Wien 1990. Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften. Beiträge zur Kultur- und Geistesgeschichte Asiens Nr. 5.
- Vostrikov = Vostrikov, A., *Tibetskaya istoričeskaya literatura*, Moskva 1962. Bibliotheca Buddhica XXXII.
- VyY = *Vyākhyāyukti*